

Filed on behalf of: VirnetX Inc.

By:

Joseph E. Palys
Paul Hastings LLP
875 15th Street NW
Washington, DC 20005
Telephone: (202) 551-1996
Facsimile: (202) 551-0496
E-mail: josephpalys@paulhastings.com

Naveen Modi
Paul Hastings LLP
875 15th Street NW
Washington, DC 20005
Telephone: (202) 551-1990
Facsimile: (202) 551-0490
E-mail: naveenmodi@paulhastings.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.
Petitioner

v.

VIRNETX INC.
Patent Owner

Case IPR2014-00238
Patent 8,504,697

Patent Owner's Response

Table of Contents

- I. Introduction.....1
- II. Mr. Fratto’s Testimony Should Not Be Given Any Weight Because He Is Not One of Ordinary Skill.....1
- III. Mr. Fratto’s Testimony Should Not Be Given Any Weight Because He Has Repeatedly Demonstrated Bias Against VirnetX’s Patents6
- IV. Claim Construction.....9
 - A. “Secure Communication Link” (Claims 1-3, 11-13, 16-17, and 24-27)10
 - 1. “Authentication” and “Address Hopping” Alone Do Not Result in a “Secure Communication Link”.....11
 - 2. VirnetX Disclaimed “Secure Communication Links” that Do Not Require Encryption15
 - B. “Virtual Private Network (VPN)” (Not a Claim Term).....19
 - C. “Intercept[ing] . . . a request to look up an internet protocol (IP) address” (Claims 1 and 16)23
 - D. “Determining, in response to the request, whether the second network device is available for a secure communications service” (Claims 1 and 16).....27
- V. *Wesinger* Does Not Anticipate Claims 1-3, 8-11, 14-17, 22-25, and 28-3031
 - A. *Wesinger’s* Disclosure.....31
 - B. *Wesinger* Does Not Disclose Each and Every Feature of the Independent Claims36
 - 1. *Wesinger* Does Not Disclose the Claimed “Determining” Features37
 - a) *Wesinger’s* Firewall Allow/Disallow Decision Does Not Occur “In Response to the Request to Look up an IP Address”37

- b) *Wesinger’s* Firewall Allow/Disallow Decision Does Not Determine “Whether the Second Network Device Is Available for [the] Secure Communications Service”46
 - 2. *Wesinger* Does Not Disclose the Claimed “Intercepting” Features47
 - C. *Wesinger* Does Not Disclose Each and Every Feature of the Dependent Claims52
 - 1. *Wesinger* Does Not Anticipate Dependent Claims 8, 9, 22, and 2352
 - 2. *Wesinger* Does Not Anticipate Dependent Claims 10 and 2953
 - 3. *Wesinger* Does Not Anticipate Dependent Claims 14 and 28.....55

- VI. Claims 4-7 and 18-21 Are Not Obvious Based on *Wesinger* in View of RFC 254356
- VII. Conclusion58

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
FEDERAL CASES	
<i>Apple Inc. v. Achates Reference Publ'g, Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00080, Paper No. 90 (June 2, 2014).....	8
<i>Ethicon, Inc. v. U.S. Surgical Corp.</i> , 135 F.3d 1456 (Fed. Cir. 1998)	8
<i>Garmin Int'l Inc. v. Cuozzo Speed Tech. LLC</i> , IPR2012-00001, Paper No. 15 (Jan. 9, 2013).....	19
<i>Grober v. Mako Prods., Inc.</i> , 686 F.3d 1335 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	18
<i>Idle Free Sys., Inc. v. Bergstrom, Inc.</i> , IPR2012-00027, Paper No. 26 (June 11, 2013).....	9, 49
<i>Jonsson v. Stanley Works</i> , 903 F.2d 812 (Fed. Cir. 1990)	18
<i>KSR Int'l. Co. v. Teleflex, Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	46
<i>Krippelz v. Ford Motor Co.</i> , 667 F.3d 1261 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	18
<i>Lindemann Maschinenfabrik v. Am. Hoist and Derrick</i> , 730 F.2d 1452 (Fed. Cir. 1984)	51
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Multi-Tech Sys., Inc.</i> , 357 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	18
<i>Motorola Solutions, Inc. v. Mobile Scanning Tech., LLC</i> , IPR2013-00093, Paper No. 28 (Apr. 29, 2013).....	19
<i>Net MoneyIN, Inc. v. VeriSign, Inc.</i> , 545 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	50
<i>Printing Indus. of Am. v. CTP Innovations, LLC</i> , IPR2013-00474, Paper No. 16 (Dec. 31, 2013).....	51

In re Robertson,
169 F.3d 743, 745 (Fed. Cir. 1999)53

ScentAir Techs., Inc. v. Prolitec, Inc.,
IPR2013-00179, Paper No. 9 (Apr. 16, 2013).....49

In re Skvorecz,
580 F.3d 1262 (Fed. Cir. 2009)9

Sundance, Inc. v. DeMonte Fabricating Ltd.,
550 F.3d 1356 (Fed. Cir. 2008)5, 6

Tagatz v. Marquette Univ.,
861 F.2d 1040 (7th Cir. 1988)8

Tempo Lighting Inc. v. Tivoli LLC,
742 F.3d 973 (Fed. Cir. 2014)16, 17

Wang Labs., Inc. v. Am. Online, Inc.,
197 F.3d 1377 (Fed. Cir. 1999)18

Xilinx, Inc. v. Intellectual Ventures I LLC,
IPR2013-00112, Paper No. 14 (June 27, 2013).....19

In re Yamamoto,
740 F.2d 1569 (Fed. Cir. 1984)9

ZTE Corp. & ZTE (USA) Inc. v. ContentGuard Holdings, Inc.,
IPR2013-00134, Paper No. 12 (June 19, 2013).....19

FEDERAL STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 103(a)46, 58

35 U.S.C. § 314.....48

35 U.S.C. § 316(e)1

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.