Filed on behalf of: RPX Corporation

Paper No. _______
Filed: March 28, 2014

By: Oliver R. Ashe, Jr., Esq.
ASHE, P.C.
11440 Isaac Newton Sq. North
Suite 210
Reston, VA 20190
Tel.: (703) 467-9001
Fax: (703) 467-9002
E-mail: oashe@ashepc.com

Gregory M. Howison
HOWISON & ARNOTT, LLP
Lincoln Centre II
5420 LBJ Freeway, Suite 660
Dallas, Texas 75240
Tel.: (972) 680-6050
Fax: (972) 479-0464
E-mail: ghowison@dalpat.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

RPX CORPORATION,
Petitioner,

v.

VIRNETX, INC. AND SCIENCE APPLICATION
INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2014-00175
Patent 7,921,211

PETITIONER'S RESPONSE TO THE BOARD'S MARCH 17, 2014 ORDER
(Regarding Real Party in Interest)

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Table of Contents

Page

I. Factual Background 1

II. RPX Is the Only Real Party in Interest in Its Inter Partes Reviews 2

1. RPX and Apple Do Not Have a "Substantive Legal Relationship" That Qualifies Under *Taylor*'s Second Exception 3

2. RPX Is Not an Agent or Representative of Apple for Purposes of *Taylor*'s Fifth Exception 5

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Table of Authorities

Page

Cases

Aevoe Corp. v. AE Tech Co., 727 F.3d 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 10

Arviv Reexamination Proceeding, *In re*, Control No. 95/001,526, Decision Dismissing § 1.182 and § 1.183 Petitions (Apr. 18, 2011) 8-9

Chicago, R.I. & P. Ry. Co. v. Schendel, 270 U.S. 611 (1926)..................................9

Cyclobenzaprine Hydrochloride Extended-Release Capsule Patent Litig., *In re*, 504 F. App'x 900 (Fed. Cir. 2013)...10

General Foods Corp. v. Massachusetts Dep't of Pub. Health, 648 F.2d 784 (1st Cir. 1981)...4

Gonzalez v. Banco Cent. Corp., 27 F.3d 751 (1st Cir. 1994)...................................8

Guan Inter Partes Reexamination Proceeding, *In re*, Control No. 95/001,045, Decision Vacating Filing Date (Aug. 25, 2008).......................10

Litchfield v. Crane, 123 U.S. 549 (1887)..4, 7

Rumford Chem. Works v. Hygienic Chem. Co. of New Jersey, 215 U.S. 156 (1909)...7

Taylor v. Sturgell, 553 U.S. 880 (2008)...*passim*

Unified Patents, Inc. v. Clouding IP, LLC, IPR2013-00586, Decision (Mar. 21, 2014)..8

United States v. Bhatia, 545 F.3d 757 (9th Cir. 2008) 8

Virginia Hosp. Ass'n v. Baliles, 830 F.2d 1308 (4th Cir. 1987)................................8

Zoll Lifecor Corp. v. Philips Elecs. N.A. Corp., IPR2013-00609, Decision (Mar. 20, 2014)..9

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Statutes and Rules

35 U.S.C. § 311(a) 2, 4

35 U.S.C. § 315(b) 9

Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(d)(2)(C) 10

Other Authorities

Office Patent Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48756 (Aug. 14, 2012)................4

Restatement (Second) of Judgments § 39 cmt. c (1982) 8

18A Charles Alan Wright et al., *Federal Practice and Procedure*,
§ 4454 at 434 (2d ed. 2002)...9

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Petitioner RPX Corp. is the only real party in interest in these *inter partes* reviews. Under the framework of *Taylor v. Sturgell*, 553 U.S. 880 (2008), RPX has no "pre-existing 'substantive legal relationship[]' " such as that of licensor, assignee, or successor, *id.* at 894, for any patent at issue; and RPX is expressly not a "designated representative" or "agent," *id.* at 895, of Apple Inc. or any other relevant entity. Accordingly, RPX has the right to petition in its own name.

Patent Owner VirnetX, Inc. fails to fit RPX within any of *Taylor*'s categories. VirnetX effectively concedes that it cannot prove Apple had control over RPX's decision to file the present IPR petitions or RPX's conduct in litigating them. Instead, VirnetX relies on factually overstated and legally deficient allegations that Apple [redacted] gave it access to Apple's counsel. Under settled law, those allegations do not establish real-party-in-interest status. The Board should grant the RPX petitions and institute the requested IPRs.

I. <u>Factual Background</u>

RPX was founded as a Delaware corporation in July 2008 and issued shares to the public in May 2011. At the end of 2013, RPX had more than 160 customers for its patent services. RPX's services include obtaining patent rights for its customers, facilitating settlement of active litigation, gathering and analyzing market intelligence and data, providing insurance against patent litigation risks, and other services to reduce patent risk to customers and to help rationalize the market

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

WHAT WILL YOU BUILD? | sales@docketalarm.com | 1-866-77-FASTCASE

fastcase® Smarter legal research.