

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES
PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BROADCOM CORPORATION	§		
Petitioner,	§		
VS.	§	IPR No.	Patent
	§	IPR2013-00601 /	6,772,215
	§	IPR2013-00602 /	6,466,568
	§	IPR2013-00636 /	6,424,625
WI-FI ONE	§		
Repondent.	§		

ORAL DEPOSITION OF

ROBERT AKL, D.Sc.

SEPTEMBER 16, 2014

ORAL DEPOSITION of ROBERT AKL, D.Sc., produced as a witness at the instance of the Petitioner and duly sworn, was taken in the above-styled and -numbered cause on the 16th of September, 2014, from 9:00 a.m. to 5:24 p.m., before Melisa Duncan, CSR in and for the State of Texas, reported by machine shorthand, at the offices of Bragalone Conroy, 2200 Ross Avenue, Suite 4500W, Dallas, Texas, in accordance with the United States Patent and Trademark Office Rules of Civil Procedure and agreement hereinafter set forth.

Broadcom v. Ericsson
IPR2013-00636
Broadcom 1021

A P P E A R A N C E S

FOR THE PETITIONER:

Zachary P. Piccolomini
zachary.piccolomini@wilmerhale.com
Dominic E. Massa (Via Phone)
dominic.massa@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
60 State Street
Boston, Massachusetts 02109
617.526.6027

FOR THE PATENT OWNER AND ROBERT AKL, D.Sc.:

John M. Shumaker
jshumaker@leehayes.com
LEE & HAYES
13809 Research Boulevard, Suite 405
Austin, Texas 78750
512.505.8162

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

PAGE

Appearances	2
ROBERT AKL, D.Sc.	
Examination by Mr. Piccolomini.	6
Examination by Mr. Shumaker	195
Signature and Changes	199
Reporter's Certificate.	201

E X H I B I T S

NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
Exhibit 1009-568	Declaration of Harry Bims, Ph.D.	6
Exhibit 2021-568	Declaration of Robert Akl, D.Sc.,	6
Exhibit 2020-568	IPR2013-00602, Motion to Amend	
Exhibit Paper 27-568	Declaration of Robert Akl, D.Sc.,	6
Exhibit Paper 27-568	IPR2013-00602, Response	
Exhibit Paper 27-568	Paper 27, March 10, 2014,	11
Exhibit 1001-568	U.S. Patent 6,566,568	28
Exhibit 1016-568	Amendment	63
Exhibit 1012-568	Patent Application, Multi-Rate	70
	Radiocommunication Systems and	
	Terminals	
Exhibit 1002-568	U.S. Patent 5,488,610	82
Exhibit 1006-568	U.S. Patent 5,541,662	88
Exhibit 2020-625	Declaration of Robert Akl, D.Sc.,	91
Exhibit 1006-625	U.S. Patent 6,424,625	
Exhibit 1007-625	Declaration of Harry Bims, Ph.D.,	94
	U.S. Patent 6,424,625	
Exhibit 1007-625	Andreas Hettich, Diploma Paper,	103
	April 17, 1996	
Exhibit Paper 25-625	Paper 25, March 10, 2014	103
Exhibit 1001-625	U.S. Patent 6,424,625	103

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

E X H I B I T S (Continued)

NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
Exhibit 2022-624	Declaration of Robert Akl, D.Sc., U.S. Patent 6,424,625	128
Exhibit 1002-625	U.S. Patent 5,610,595	134
Exhibit 2019-625	Ulrich Vornefeld, Diploma Paper, April 1, 1997	142
Exhibit 1004-215	Declaration of Harry Bims, Ph.D., U.S. Patent 6,772,215	150
Exhibit Paper 29-215	Paper 29, IPR2013-00601	151
Exhibit 1001-215	U.S. Patent 6,772,215	160
Exhibit 2020-215	Declaration of Robert Akl, D.Sc., U.S. Patent 6,772,215	160
Exhibit 1002-215	U.S. Patent 6,581,176	160
Exhibit 2021-215	Amendments to Claims	186
Exhibit 1010-215	TIA/EIA Interim Standard	191

FOUNDED

P R O C E E D I N G S

1
2 THE REPORTER: We are now on the record for
3 the oral deposition of Robert Akl, D.Sc. The time is
4 approximately 9:00 a.m. on September 16, 2014. In the
5 matter of Broadcom Corp. vs. Wi-Fi One, Case Nos.
6 IPR 2013-00601, IPR 2013-00602 and IPR 2013-00636, being
7 held in the United States Patent and Trademark Office.

8 The court reporter is Melisa Duncan,
9 representative of Esquire Deposition Solutions.

10 Today's deposition is being held at
11 Bragalone Conroy, located at 2200 Ross Avenue,
12 Suite 4500W, Dallas, Texas.

13 Will counsel please state their appearances
14 for the record, after which I will then swear in the
15 witness.

16 MR. PICCOLOMINI: Sure. This is Zach
17 Piccolomini on behalf of Broadcom Corporation, the
18 petitioner.

19 MR. SHUMAKER: John Shumaker on behalf of
20 the patent owner and also the deponent Robert Akl.

21 ROBERT AKL, D.Sc.,
22 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:

23 EXAMINATION

24 BY MR. PICCOLOMINI:

25 Q. Good morning.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.