

By: Cary Kappel, Lead Counsel
William Gehris, Backup Counsel
Davidson, Davidson & Kappel, LLC
485 Seventh Avenue
New York, NY 10018
Telephone (212) 736-1257
(212) 736-2015
Facsimile (212) 736-2427
E-mail: ckappel@ddkpatent.com
wgehris@ddkpatent.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SMITH & NEPHEW, INC.

Petitioner,

v.

BONUTTI SKELETAL INNOVATIONS LLC

Patent Owner

Case: IPR2013-00629

Patent 7,806,896

**PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.120**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. The '896 patent.....1

II. The Priority Date of Claim 1 of the '896 patent.....9

III. The Prior Art of the Instituted Grounds.....10

 A. Stulberg.....11

 B. Delp.....13

 C. Turner.....16

 D. Scorpio.....17

IV. Petitioner Has Not Established that Claim 1 is Unpatentable Under
35 U.S.C. §103 as Obvious Over Stulberg in view of Turner or
Scorpio.....21

 A. Stulberg In view of Turner.....24

 1. Stulberg and Turner are Not Combinable.....24

 2. Even if Combined, Stulberg and Turner Would Not
 Create the Claimed Invention.....30

 B. Stulberg in view of Scorpio.....32

 1. Stulberg and Scorpio are Not Combinable.....32

 2. Even if Combined Stulberg and Scorpio Would Not
 Create the Claimed Invention.....35

V. Petitioner Has Not Established that Claim 1 is Unpatentable Under
35 U.S.C. §103 as Obvious Over Delp in view of Turner or

Scorpio.....	45
A. Delp in view of Turner.....	47
1. Delp and Turner are Not Combinable.....	48
2. Even if Combined Delp and Turner Would Not Create the Claimed Invention.....	51
B. Delp in view of Scorpio.....	53
1. Delp and Scorpio are Not Combinable.....	53
2. Even if Combined Delp and Scorpio Would Not Create the Claimed Invention.....	54
VI. Conclusion.....	59

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<u>In re Abbott Diabetes Care, Inc.</u> , 696 F.3d 1142 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	39, 40
<u>Ex parte Datacard Corp.</u> , Appeal 2009-013947, 2010 Pat. App. LEXIS 15588 (Pat. App. 2010).....	44, 52
<u>Ex parte Frede</u> , Appeal 2010-008757, 2012 Pat. App. LEXIS 4492 (Pat. App. 2012)	31, 45, 52, 58
<u>Ex parte Habashi et al</u> , Appeal 2011-008847, 2013 Pat. App. LEXIS 8057 (Pat. App. 2013)	43
<u>In re:HOEG et al</u> , Appeal 2011-011778, 2014 Pat. App. LEXIS 1132 (Pat. App. 2014)	23, 29, 47
<u>Ex Parte Kodas, et al</u> , Appeal 2008-3302, 2008 Pat. App. LEXIS 8431 (Pat. App. 2008)	26
<u>Ex parte LIN et al</u> , Appeal 2011-009169, 2014 Pat. App. LEXIS 951 (Pat. App. 2014)	24, 29, 47
<u>Ex parte McKiernan et al</u> , Appeal 2011-012188, 2012 Pat. App. LEXIS 5598, *9-11 (Pat. App. 2012).....	39
<u>Ex parte Vanscoyok</u> , Appeal 2011-011717, 2013 Pat. App. LEXIS 7627 (Pat. App. 2013)	43
<u>Grain Processing Corp. v. American-Maize Prods. Co.</u> , 840 F.2d 902, 907 (Fed. Cir. 1988)	27, 51
<u>In re Hedges</u> , 783 F.2d 1038, 1041 (Fed. Cir. 1986).....	28
<u>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex, Inc.</u> , 550 U.S. 398, 417 (2007).....	23,24,26,47
<u>In re NTP, Inc.</u> , 654 F.3d 1279 (Fed. Cir. 2011)	27, 44, 51, 56

<u>Orthopedic Equip Co. v. United States</u>	27, 51
<u>In re Suitco Surface, Inc.</u> , 603 F.3d 1255, 1260 (Fed. Cir. 2011)	39
<u>Velander v. Garner</u> , 348 F.3d 1359, 1371 (Fed. Cir. 2003).....	43
<u>Versata Development Group, Inc., v. Sap America, Inc.</u> , Appeal No. 2014-1194 ...	40
<u>W.L. Gore & Assoc., Inc. v. Garlock, Inc.</u> , 721 F.2d 1540, 220 USPQ 303 (Fed. Cir. 1983)	44,52

Statutes/Regulations

35 U.S.C. § 103	21, 45
35 U.S.C. § 316(a)(8).....	2
35 U.S.C. § 316(e)	2
37 C.F.R. § 42.120	2

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.