

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
HONORABLE MICHAEL M. ANELLO, DISTRICT JUDGE

MEDTRONIC SOFAMOR DANEK, USA)
ET AL.,) CASE NO. 08 CV 1512-MMA
)
PLAINTIFF,)
)
VS.) DECEMBER 16, 2011
)
NUVASIVE, INC.,) FRIDAY, 9:00 AM
)
DEFENDANT.) BENCH TRIAL
_____) VOLUME 1

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

APPEARANCES:

FOR THE PLAINTIFF: LUKE L. DAUCHOT, ESQ.
NIMALKA WICKRAMASEKERA, ESQ.
SHARRE LOTFOLLAHI, ESQ.
ALEXANDER F. MACKINNON, ESQ.
MICHAEL DOBSZEWICZ, ESQ.
KIRKLAND & ELLIS, LLP

JEFF SCHWARTZ, ESQ.
DEWEY & LEBOEUF

FOR THE DEFENDANT: FRANK SCHERKENBACH, ESQ.
TODD G. MILLER, ESQ.
JONATHAN J. LAMBERSON, ESQ.
NEIL WARREN, ESQ.
KEELEY I. VEGA, ESQ.
FISH & RICHARDSON, P.C.

ELIZABETH CESENA, CSR 12266, (619) 237-0100
USDC, SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CA
PO BOX 131037, SAN DIEGO, CA 92170



1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

INDEX - 08CV1512, 12/16/11

WITNESSES:	PAGE:
DR. BRUCE VAN DAM	
DIRECT BY MR. SCHERKENBACH	5
CROSS BY MR. DAUCHOT	34
REDIRECT BY MR. SCHERKENBACH	79
RE-CROSS BY MR. DAUCHOT	93
RE-REDIRECT BY MR. SCHERKENBACH	96
DR. BARTON LEWIS SACHS	
DIRECT BY MS. WICKRAMASEKERA	98
AFTERNOON PROCEEDINGS	183
DR. GARY KARLIN MICHELSON	
CROSS BY MR. SCHERKENBACH	184
REDIRECT BY MR. DAUCHOT	200
JAMES THOMAS CARMICHAEL	
DIRECT BY MR. MACKINNON	202
CROSS BY MR. SCHERKENBACH	222
REDIRECT BY MR. MACKINNON	245
RE-CROSS BY MR. SCHERKENBACH	250
DR. BRUCE VAN DAM	
REBUTTAL BY MR. SCHERKENBACH	252

ELIZABETH CESENA, CSR 12266, (619) 237-0100
USDC, SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CA
PO BOX 131037, SAN DIEGO, CA 92170



1 WITH THE ANTEROLATERAL INCISION, THE BIG OPEN POSITION, PEEL
2 BACK THE PSOAS MUSCLE AND THEN ENTER THE DISC SPACE
3 COMPLETELY LATERAL. OKAY? THAT'S A FOR EXAMPLE AND THAT'S
4 WHAT HE'S REFERRING TO. EXCUSE ME.

5 Q SO HE WASN'T REFERRING TO APPROACHING -- AND WE'VE
6 COVERED THAT. THAT'S FINE. MY ONLY POINT IS THIS. WHEN
7 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT JUST BECAUSE YOU HAVE A PATIENT ON THE
8 SIDE ON THE OPERATING TABLE AND YOU DECIDE TO CUT A PATIENT
9 FROM THE SIDE, OKAY? DOESN'T MEAN THAT YOU'RE GOING TO BE
10 PERFORMING A DIRECT LATERAL, AM I CORRECT?

11 A WELL, YOU MIGHT END UP ANTEROLATERAL. IT JUST DEPENDS
12 ON WHAT KIND OF ANATOMY YOU ARE TRYING TO APPROACH.

13 Q THERE YOU GO. SO WHEN WE TALK ABOUT AND ANTEROLATERAL
14 SO IN ANTEROLATERAL, I THINK THIS WAS YOUR TESTIMONY AT
15 TRIAL IS BASICALLY --

16 A YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE A MUCH BETTER MEMORY THAN I DO, BUT
17 GO AHEAD.

18 Q THAT'S ALL RIGHT. I'M YOUNGER. ANTEROLATERAL MEANS
19 OBLIQUE TO THE CENTER?

20 A WELL, TECHNICALLY ANTEROLATERAL WOULD MEAN ANY ANGLE
21 OFF A DIRECT STRAIGHT MIDLINE 90-DEGREE APPROACH.

22 Q SURE. BUT DURING TRIAL, WE WERE DISTINGUISHING BETWEEN
23 THE ANTEROLATERAL AND THE DIRECT LATERAL?

24 A CORRECT. THAT'S EXACTLY RIGHT. AS YOU ILLUSTRATE UP
25 THERE, THAT'S CORRECT.

ELIZABETH CESENA, CSR 12266, (619) 237-0100
USDC, SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CA
PO BOX 131037, SAN DIEGO, CA 92170

1 Q SURE. AND WHAT YOU WERE SAYING IS WHEN YOU WERE
2 CUTTING THE PATIENT OR PUTTING THE PATIENT ON THE SIDE AND
3 YOU ARE MAKING A LATERAL INCISION, OKAY? THE AIM VERY WELL
4 COULD BE APPROACHING IT ANTERO Laterally AS OPPOSED TO
5 DIRECT LATERAL?

6 A FAIR POINT. AND COULD BE, IF I JUST BE SPECIFIC, AIM
7 COULD BE TO INSERT THE IMPLANT ANTEROLATERAL OR DIRECT
8 LATERAL.

9 Q OKAY. WE'RE ON THE SAME PAGE. SO CAN WE TURN TO DX
10 5885? PAGE EIGHT. CAN YOU BLOW UP FOR ME, DAVID, ON THE
11 SECOND COLUMN, THE PARAGRAPH ENTITLED "POSITIONING".

12 OKAY. NOW IT STATES IN THE SECOND SENTENCE OR
13 FIRST SENTENCE, FOR APPROACHES TO THE LOWER THREE LUMBAR
14 INTERVERTEBRAL DISCS, PATIENTS ARE PLACED SUPINE ON THE
15 OPERATING TABLE, RIGHT?

16 A THAT'S WHAT IT SAYS.

17 Q AND YOU'VE TESTIFIED THAT LOWER THREE LUMBAR
18 INTERVERTEBRAL DISCS MEANS TO YOU, THE L FOUR, L FIVE AND
19 THE L FIVE S-1?

20 A WELL, HE IS SAYING THE LOWER THREE LUMBER DISCS. THE
21 LOWER THREE LUMBAR DISCS ARE NOT ONLY TO ME BUT EVERYBODY
22 ELSE HOPEFULLY, L3-4, L4-5 AND L5 S1.

23 Q THAT'S WHAT I JUST SAID.

24 A NO. I THINK YOU SAID L FOUR AND L5 S-1.

25 Q BUT YOU CONSIDER L3 AND L4 TO BE UPPER?

ELIZABETH CESENA, CSR 12266, (619) 237-0100
USDC, SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CA
PO BOX 131037, SAN DIEGO, CA 92170

1 Q OKAY. NOW CAN WE GO BACK TO DX 5885, PAGE EIGHT? THE
2 POSITIONING PART.

3 NOW ON THE SECOND SENTENCE HE STATES, FOR RARE
4 UPPER LUMBAR FUSIONS, THEY, THEY BEING THE PATIENTS, ARE
5 PLACED IN THE LATERAL POSITION WITH THE LEFT LOIN UPPERMOST.
6 RIGHT?

7 A YES.

8 Q OKAY. NOW GIVEN YOUR PRIOR TESTIMONY, THAT STATEMENT
9 DOES NOT TELL YOU HOW THE IMPLANT IS IMPLANTED IN THE
10 VERTEBRAL SPACE, CORRECT?

11 A CORRECT. IT WOULDN'T TELL YOU EXACTLY HOW THE IMPLANT
12 IS PLACED IN THE DISC SPACE BUT IT CERTAINLY GIVING YOU THE
13 ORIENTATION OF THE PATIENT, YES, FOR THE APPROACH, FOR THE
14 ACCESS.

15 Q ACCORDING TO YOUR PRIOR TESTIMONY, THAT STATEMENT IS
16 COMPLETELY CONSISTENT WITH THE INSERTION OF AN IMPLANT FROM
17 ANTEROLATERAL SO JUST OFF THE MIDLINE OF THE FRONT OF THE
18 DISC SPACE. THAT WAS YOUR TESTIMONY HERE, CORRECT.

19 A YES. AND I WOULD JUST AGAIN TO BE PRECISE, THE
20 APPROACH TO THE LUMBAR SPINE WITH A PATIENT IN A LATERAL
21 DECUBITUS OR A SIDE POSITION, WOULD PERMIT YOU TO, ACTUALLY
22 YOU CAN GO STRAIGHT ANTERIORLY BUT NOT VERY CONVENIENTLY,
23 WOULD PERMIT YOU FAIRLY CONVENIENTLY TO PUT AN IMPLANT IN
24 ANTERO LATERALLY OR IF YOU PEEL BACK THE PSOAS MUSCLE
25 DIRECTLY LATERALLY.

ELIZABETH CESENA, CSR 12266, (619) 237-0100
USDC, SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CA
PO BOX 131037, SAN DIEGO, CA 92170

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.