

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INNOLUX CORPORATION
Petitioner

v.

PATENT OF SEMICONDUCTOR ENERGY LABORATORY CO., LTD.
Patent Owner

CASE IPR2013-00066
PATENT 7,876,413

**NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL EVIDENCE
IN RESPONSE TO OBJECTION OF PETITIONER**

EXHIBIT LIST

Previously Filed

Exhibit 2001 – Complaint, *Semiconductor Energy Laboratory Co., Ltd. v. Chimei Innolux Corp., et al.*, Case No. SACV 12-0021-JST (C.D. Cal).

Exhibit 2002 – Defendants' Motion to Stay Litigation Pending Outcome of Inter Partes Review, *Semiconductor Energy Laboratory Co., Ltd. v. Chimei Innolux Corp., et al.*

Exhibit 2003 – Supplemental Declaration of Gregory S. Cordrey in Support of Defendants' Motion for Stay, *Semiconductor Energy Laboratory Co., Ltd. v. Chimei Innolux Corp., et al.*

Exhibit 2004 – Defendants' Reply in Support of their Motion to Stay, *Semiconductor Energy Laboratory Co., Ltd. v. Chimei Innolux Corp., et al.*

Exhibit 2005 – Defendant Westinghouse Digital's Notice of Joinder, *Semiconductor Energy Laboratory Co., Ltd. v. Chimei Innolux Corp., et al.*

Exhibit 2006 – Prosecution File History of US application serial no. 12/252,793 (US Patent No. 7,876,413) Excerpt – Prior Art considered by the Office

Exhibit 2007 – Sasuga, US Patent No. 5,432,626

Exhibit 2008 – Display search Laboratory website material

Exhibit 2009 – Sukegawa FIG. 1B marked by Dr. Hatalis at deposition to show vertical and horizontal limits of the opening in insulation film 9

Exhibit 2010 – Sukegawa FIG. 2C marked by Dr. Hatalis at deposition to show hypothetical placement of a sealant

Exhibit 2011 – Dr. Hatalis deposition transcript, July 1, 2013

Exhibit 2012 – Declaration of Michael Escuti, PhD

Exhibit 2013 – materials from LG website <TFT process>

Exhibit 2014 – materials from CPT website <TFT process>

Exhibit 2015 – materials from ShinMaywa website <evaporator>

Exhibit 2016 – materials from Pascal website <laser deposition>

Exhibit 2017 – materials from MicroTec website <screen printing>

Exhibit 2018 – materials from ULVAC website <laser ablation>

Exhibit 2019 – materials from MicroFab website <ion beam etch technology>

Exhibit 2020 – materials from SIJ website <inkjet>

Exhibit 2021 – Henley_SID DIGEST OF TECHNICAL PAPERS 1994

Exhibit 2022 – Shiba, US Patent No. 5,684,555, IPR2013-00068, Ex. 1003.

Exhibit 2023 – Dr. Hatalis deposition transcript, July 2, 2013, for No. IPR2013-00068

Exhibit 2024 – Watanabe US Patent No. 5,504,601

Currently Filed

Exhibit 2025 - Supplemental Declaration of Dr. Michael J. Escuti

Exhibit 2026 - Deposition transcript of Michael J. Escuti, dated September 6, 2013, for No. IPR 2013-00068

Exhibit 2027 - Deposition transcript of Michael J. Escuti, dated September 5, 2013, for No. IPR 2013-00066

Exhibit 2028 - G.P. Crawford and M.J. Escuti, *Liquid Crystal Display Technology*, in Encyclopedia of Imaging Science and Technology, ed. J.P. Hornak, (John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2002)

Exhibit 2029 - Syllabus: 492/592-003 - Soft Electronics: Organic Devices & Liquid Crystal Displays

Exhibit 2030 - Lab Module 4 of 4: OTFT: Fabrication and Characterization of an Organic Thin Film Transistor

Exhibit 2031 - 2006-2473: A New Introductory Course on Signals, Circuits and Systems

Exhibit 2032 - Syllabus for ECE 303 - Electromagnetic Fields.

Exhibit 2033 - Syllabus for E 304 - Intro to Nano Science & Technology.

Exhibit 2034 - Walter F. Goede, Seminar M-1: Status of Electronic Displays, Society For Information Display, 1996.

Exhibit 2035 - Colin Prince, Seminar M-3: Active-Matrix LCDs, Society For Information Display, 1997.

Exhibit 2036 - Terence J. Nelson, Seminar M-1: Electronic Information Display Perspective, Society For Information Display, 1998.

Exhibit 2037 - Interactive Information Display Tutorial

Exhibit 2038 - Komanduri et al., *Late-News Paper*: Polarization Independent Liquid Crystal Microdisplays, IPR2013-00068, Ex. 1008.

Semiconductor Energy Laboratory Co., Ltd. (“Patent Owner”) provides this Notice of Supplemental Evidence in Response to Objection of Innolux Corporation (“Petitioner”) dated September 12, 2013 and respectfully submits that Dr. Michael J. Escuti does qualify as a person of ordinary skill in the art at the relevant time. In response to Petitioner’s objection, Patent Owner submits Exhibits 2025-2038 as supplemental evidence pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(2).

Section 42.64(b)(1) requires that evidentiary objections “must identify the grounds for the objection with sufficient particularity to allow correction in the form of supplemental evidence.” 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1); 77 Fed. Reg. 48676 (Aug. 14, 2012). Petitioner objected on the grounds that Dr. Escuti’s “expertise is in photonics and liquid crystals rather than the TFT technology at issue in ‘413 patent.” *See* paper No. 28, page 2. Dr. Escuti, however, provided testimony explicitly demonstrating his TFT design and fabrication experience and expertise, which is the TFT technology at issue in U.S. Patent No. 7,876,413 (the “413 patent” (Ex. 1001). *See* Exhibit 2025, Supplemental Declaration of Dr. Michael J. Escuti. Moreover, Dr. Escuti’s declaration, curriculum vitae, and deposition testimony together demonstrate that he is knowledgeable as to the level of skill of persons of ordinary skill in the art at the time when the patent application to which the ’413 patent claim priority was filed. Thus, Petitioner’s objection is not well grounded considering the record as a whole. It is unclear what experience

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.