

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LKQ CORPORATION
Petitioner

v.

CLEARLAMP, LLC
Patent Owner

Case IPR2013-00020 (SCM)
Patent 7,297,364

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS IN DISPUTE.....	1
I. INTRODUCTION	2
II. ARGUMENT	7
A. Grounds of Unpatentability at Issue.....	7
1. Obviousness over the combination of Kuta and Butt of claims 1-24	7
2. Obviousness over the combination of Kuta and Eastwood of claims 1-24.....	8
B. Art Cited in The Petitions.....	8
1. Kuta.....	8
2. Butt.....	11
3. Eastwood.....	11
C. Construction of Claim Terms	12
1. Removing an Original Clear Coat Finish From the Lamp Surface of the Lamp.....	12
2. Evening the Lamp Surface.....	15
3. Statically Neutralizing Debris.....	17

D.	Neither a Combination of Kuta and Butt, Nor a Combination of Kuta and Eastwood, Render the Invention Claimed in Original Claims 1-24 Obvious.....	20
1.	Claims 1-24 are Not Obvious Because Kuta Does Not Disclose Several Limitations of the Claims.....	20
2.	Claims 13-22 and 24 are Not Obvious Because Kuta Does Not Disclose Several Limitations of the Claims.....	31
3.	Claims 11 and 15 are Not Obvious Because Kuta Does Not Disclose Applying Infrared Radiation to the Lamp Surface	33
4.	Claims 12 and 16 are Not Obvious Because Kuta Does Not Disclose Heating the Lamp in an Oven	36
E.	Secondary Considerations of Non-Obviousness Support the Conclusion that Claims 1-24 Are Patentable	37
1.	Copying By Others.....	38
2.	Commercial Success	46
III.	CONCLUSION.....	48

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Applied Med. Res. Corp. v. U.S. Surgical Corp.</i> , 448 F.3d 1324 (Fed. Cir. 2006).....	15
<i>CAE Screenplates Inc. v. Heinrich Fiedler GmbH</i> , 224 F.3d 1308 (Fed. Cir. 2000).....	15
<i>Interactive Gift Exp., Inc. v. Compuserve, Inc.</i> , 257 F.3d 1323 (Fed. Cir. 2001).....	17, 18
<i>Loral Fairchild Corp. v. Sony Corp.</i> , 181 F.3d 1313	18
<i>Merck & Co. v. Teva Pharm. USA, Inc.</i> , 395 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2005).....	46
<i>Ring Plus, Inc. v. Cingular Wireless Corp.</i> , 614 F.3d 1354 (Fed. Cir. 2010).....	18
<i>Specialty Composites v. Cabot Corp.</i> , 845 F.2d 981 (Fed. Cir. 1988).....	38
<i>Spectralytics, Inc. v. Cordis Corp.</i> , 649 F.3d 1336 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....	47
<i>Stratoflex, Inc. v. Aeroquip Corp.</i> , 713 F.2d 1530 (Fed. Cir. 1983).....	37
<i>Transocean Offshore Deepwater Drilling, Inc. v. Maersk Contractors USA, Inc.</i> , 699 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	37, 45, 46
<i>Windsurfing Int'l, Inc. v. AMF, Inc.</i> , 782 F.2d 995 (Fed. Cir. 1986), cert. denied, 477 U.S. 905 (1986).....	38
STATUTES	
35 U.S.C. § 102	5

OTHER AUTHORITIES

37 C.F.R. § 42.23(a).....1

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.