

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

In re U.S. Patent No. 6,240,376	Trial No.:	IPR 2012-00042
Application No.: 09/127,587		
Filed: July 31, 1998		
Issued: May 29, 2001		
Inventors: Alain Raynaud Luc M. Burgun	Atty. Dkt. No.	007121.00004
Patent Owner: Mentor Graphics Corporation		
For: METHOD AND APPARATUS FOR GATE- LEVEL SIMULATION OF SYNTHESIZED REGISTER TRANSFER LEVEL DESIGNS WITH SOURCE-LEVEL DEBUGGING		

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

PRELIMINARY RESPONSE BY PATENT OWNER
UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.107

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	The Requested <i>Inter partes</i> Review Is Barred Under 35 U.S.C. § 315(b).....	1
A.	Background, Including Service Of Complaint On EVE In 2006 Asserting Infringement of the ‘376 Patent.....	2
B.	EVE and Synopsys Are In Privity.....	5
II.	There Is No Reasonable Likelihood of Petitioner Prevailing As To A Challenged Claim of the `376 Patent.....	9
A.	Technology Background	9
B.	Introduction To and Overview of Patent Owner’s Response To Petitioner’s Invalidity Arguments	12
C.	Patent Owner’s Response To Petitioner’s Unpatentability Arguments	15
1.	There Is No Reasonable Likelihood of Any of Claims 1- 5, 8-10, 20-24, 28 and 32-33 Being Found to be Anticipated by Koch (SYNOPSISYS 1004).....	15
2.	There Is No Reasonable Likelihood of Any of Claims 11 and 25-27 Being Found to be Rendered Obvious by Koch (SYNOPSISYS 1004) in View of Koch 1995 (SYNOPSISYS 1006)	27
3.	There Is No Reasonable Likelihood of Any of Claims 1- 9, 11-14, 24-25 and 28-33 Being Found to be Anticipated or Rendered Obvious by Gregory (SYNOPSISYS 1007).....	30
4.	There Is No Reasonable Likelihood of Any of Claims 10, 15, 20-23 and 26-27 Being Found to be Rendered Obvious by Gregory (SYNOPSISYS 1007) in view of Koch 1995 (SYNOPSISYS 1006).....	36
5.	There Is No Reasonable Likelihood of Any of Claims 1, 2, 5, 10-11 and 28 Being Found to be Anticipated Or Rendered Obvious by the HDL-ICE Brochure (SYNOPSISYS 1009)	40
6.	There Is No Reasonable Likelihood of Any of Claims 1, 2, 5, 10 and 28 Being Found to be Anticipated Or Rendered Obvious by Sample (SYNOPSISYS 1010)	43

7.	There Is No Reasonable Likelihood of Claim 11 Being Found to be Rendered Obvious by Sample (SYNOPSISYS 1010) in View of Koch 1995 (SYNOPSISYS 1006)	46
III.	Conclusion	46

EXHIBIT LIST

- MG 2001 First Amended Complaint in *Mentor Graphics Corp. v. EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering, SA*, 6:06-CV-00341-AA (D. OR., filed March 13, 2006)
- MG 2002 Defendants' Unopposed Motion By Special Appearance For Extension Of Time To Respond To Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint in *Mentor Graphics Corp. v. EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering, SA*, 6:06-CV-00341-AA (D. Or., filed May 23, 2006)
- MG 2003 Order of Dismissal in *Mentor Graphics Corp. v. EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering, SA*, 6:06-CV-00341-AA (D. Or., filed November 20, 2006)
- MG 2004 Complaint for Declaratory Judgment and Injunctive Relief in *Synopsys, Inc., EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering, S.A. v. Mentor Graphics Corp.*, 3:12-cv-050025-LB (N.D. Cal., filed September 27, 2012)
- MG 2005 Banner & Witcoff, Ltd.'s "Messenger Log"
- MG 2006 October 4, 2012 Synopsys Press Release "Synopsys Acquires EVE"
- MG 2007 EVE-USA's Supplemental Corporate Disclosure Statement, Docket No. 7, *Synopsys, Inc. et al. v. Mentor Graphics Corp.*, 3:12-CV-05025-MC (N.D. Cal. filed October. 26, 2012)
- MG 2008 Jansen, D., *The Electronic Design Automation Handbook*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2003, Chapter 2
- MG 2009 Bhatnagar, *Advanced ASIC Chip Synthesis: Using Synopsys® Design Compiler™ and PrimeTime®*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1999
- MG 2010 Gregory et al. U.S. Patent No. 5,937,190

MG 2011

HDL Compiler™ for VHDL User Guide, Version F-2011.09-
SP4, March 2012, SYNOPSYS, Section 4

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.