

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

In re U.S. Patent No. 6,240,376

Trial No.: IPR 2012-00042

Application No.: 09/127,587

Filed: July 31, 1998

Issued: May 29, 2001

Atty. Dkt. No. 007121.00004

Inventors: Alain Raynaud
Luc M. Burgun

Patent Owner: Mentor Graphics
Corporation

For: METHOD AND APPARATUS
FOR GATE-LEVEL
SIMULATION OF
SYNTHESIZED REGISTER
TRANSFER LEVEL DESIGNS
WITH SOURCE-LEVEL
DEBUGGING

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

**PATENT OWNER'S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF ITS SUBSTITUTE MOTION TO AMEND
UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.121**

Table of Contents

I. Petitioner and Its Expert Improperly Interpret the Substitute Claims	1
II. Petitioner’s Reading of the Substitute Claims on Gregory is Faulty.....	2
III. Petitioner’s Alleged “Knowledge And Skill Possessed By An Ordinarily Skilled Artisan” Fails To Rebut The Demonstrated Non-Obviousness.....	3

EXHIBIT LIST

Previously Filed

- MG 2001 First Amended Complaint in *Mentor Graphics Corp. v. EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering*, SA, 6:06-CV-00341-AA (D. OR., filed March 13, 2006)
- MG 2002 Defendants' Unopposed Motion By Special Appearance For Extension Of Time To Respond To Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint in *Mentor Graphics Corp. v. EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering*, SA, 6:06-CV-00341-AA (D. Or., filed May 23, 2006)
- MG 2003 Order of Dismissal in *Mentor Graphics Corp. v. EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering*, SA, 6:06-CV-00341-AA (D. Or., filed November 20, 2006)
- MG 2004 Complaint for Declaratory Judgment and Injunctive Relief in *Synopsys, Inc., EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering, S.A. v. Mentor Graphics Corp.*, 3:12-cv-05025 (N.D. Cal., filed September 27, 2012)
- MG 2005 Banner & Witcoff, Ltd.'s "Messenger Log"
- MG 2006 October 4, 2012 Synopsys Press Release "Synopsys Acquires EVE"
- MG 2007 EVE-USA's Supplemental Corporate Disclosure Statement, Docket No. 7, filed October 26, 2012 in *Synopsys, Inc. et al. v. Mentor Graphics Corp.*, 3:12-CV-05025 (N.D. Cal. filed September 27, 2012)
- MG 2008 Jansen, D., The Electronic Design Automation Handbook, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2003, Chapter 2
- MG 2009 Bhatnagar, Advanced ASIC Chip Synthesis: Using Synopsys® Design Compiler™ and PrimeTime®, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1999
- MG 2010 Gregory et al. U.S. Patent No. 5,937,190

- MG 2011 HDL Compiler™ for VHDL User Guide, Version F-2011.09-SP4, March 2012, SYNOPSYS, Section 4
- MG 2012 Plaintiffs' Opposition to Mentor Graphics Corporation's Motion to Transfer, dated January 25, 2013
- MG 2013 Notice of Incomplete Petition, mailed November 30, 2012 in *CMI Corp. v. Yoshiharu, et. al.*, PTAB Case IPR 2013-00066
- MG 2014 Response to Notice of *Incomplete* Petition Issued November 30, 2012, filed November 30, 2012 in *CMI Corp. v. Yoshiharu, et. al.*, PTAB Case IPR 2013-00066
- MG 2015 Notice of Filing Date Accorded to Petition and Time for Filing Patent Owner Preliminary Response, mailed December 5, 2012 in *CMI Corp. v. Yoshiharu, et. al.*, PTAB Case IPR 2013-00066
- MG 2016 Declaration of Allison Anderson
- MG 2017 Notice of Filing Date Accorded to Petition and Notice for Setting the Time Period for Filing Patent Owner Preliminary Response
- MG 2018 [Proposed] Patent Owner's Requests for Production To Petitioner
- MG 2019 [Proposed] Patent Owner's Interrogatories To Petitioner
- MG 2020 [Proposed] Patent Owner's Requests for Admission To Petitioner
- MG 2021 [Proposed] Patent Owner's Notice of Deposition of Petitioner Synopsys
- MG 2022 Assignment of the '376 Patent from inventors to Mentor Graphics Corp
- MG 2023 Notice of Party Name Change, filed March 22, 2013, in *EVE-USA, Inc. and Emulation and Verification Engineering, S.A. v. Mentor Graphics Corp.*, 3:12-cv-05025 (N.D. Cal., filed September 27, 2012)
- MG 2024 Slide presentation "Meeting Verification Challenges" by Luc Burgun, VP, Synopsys Emulation Division, Verification Group, November 2012

- MG 2025 Silicon Valley Wire press release "Mountain View Based Synopsys Acquires EVE," dated October 4, 2012
- MG 2026 LinkedIn Profile of Luc Burgun listing his employment history
- MG 2027 Declaration of Majid Sarrafzadeh, PH.D in Support of Patent Owner Response, including Exhibits A through E thereto
- MG2028 Declaration of Michael Sapoznikow in Support of Mentor Graphics Corporation's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment, filed 05/31/13 in Case 3:10-cv-00954-MO Doc. 369 (exhibit 5)
- MG2029 Declaration Of Patrick M. Bible In Support Of Mentor Graphics Corporation's Motion For Partial Summary Judgment, filed 05/31/13 in Case 3:10-cv-00954-MO Doc. 368 (exhibits 2, 3, 8, 9-11, 15, 18-21, 27, 30, 32-34, 40)

Currently Filed

- MG2030 Annotated Figure 13 of the Gregory et al. '109 Patent (Hutchings Deposition Exhibit)
- MG2031 Annotated Figure 17 of the Gregory et al. '109 Patent (Hutchings Deposition Exhibit)
- MG2032 Transcript of Deposition of Brad Hutchings Ph.D. conducted September 20, 2013
- MG2033 Declaration of William D. Davis

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.