

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

Ford Motor Company
Petitioner,

v.

Versata Software, Inc.
Patent Owner.

U.S. Patent No. 8,805,825

CMB Case No.: 2016-00100

DECLARATION OF DEBORAH L. McGUINNESS, Ph.D.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Exhibits.....	3
I. Introduction.....	4
II. Qualifications and professional experience.....	5
III. Relevant legal standards.....	9
A. 35 U.S.C. § 112.....	9
IV. Qualifications of one of ordinary skill in the art.....	11
V. Challenged claims of the ‘825 Patent and proposed claim constructions.....	12
VI. The ‘825 Patent claims cover what humans did before computers.....	12
VII. Claims 1-20 of the ‘825 Patent could be performed by a human using only pen and paper.....	19
A. Independent claims 1, 6, 11, and 16.....	19
B. The dependent claims of the ‘825 Patent.....	32
VIII. Claims 16 and 20 of the ‘825 Patent are indefinite because their structure is directed to a special purpose computer programmed to implement an algorithm not disclosed in the ‘825 Patent.....	34
A. Claim 16 of the ‘825 Patent.....	34
1. Claim 16 “means for receiving” limitation no. 1.....	34
2. Claim 16 “means for processing” limitation.....	37
3. Claim 16 “means for predetermining” limitation.....	40
4. Claim 16 “means for retrieving” limitation.....	42
5. Claim 16 “means for receiving” limitation no. 2.....	44
6. Claim 16 “means for prioritizing” limitation.....	46
7. Claim 16 “means for providing” limitation.....	49
B. Claim 20 of the ‘825 Patent.....	51
1. Claim 20 “means for receiving” limitation.....	51
2. Claim 20 “means for prioritizing” limitation.....	53
IX. Conclusion.....	56

List of Exhibits

Exhibit No.	Description	Identifier
1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,805,825	'825 Patent
1002	Declaration of Deborah McGuinness	
1003	Federal Register – August 14, 2012 (Part IV)	
1004	<i>A Guide to the Legislative History of the America Invents Act; Part II of II</i> , 21 Fed. Cir. Bar J. No. 4 (2002), pp. 539-653	AIA Legislative History Guide
1005	Federal Register – August 14, 2012 (Part V)	
1006	'825 Patent File History	
1007	2002 Lincoln Continental Order Guide	
1008	2002 Lincoln Continental Price List	
1009	Versata Claim Construction Disclosure Document	
1010	McGuinness <i>Curriculum Vitae</i>	
1011	Stefik, <i>Introduction to Knowledge Systems</i> (1995)	Stefik
1012	McDermott, <i>RI: an Expert in the Computer Systems Domain</i> , Proceedings AAAI-80 (1980)	McDermott
1013	McGuinness et al., <i>An Industrial-Strength Description Logic-Based Configurator Platform</i> , IEEE Intelligent Systems (1998)	
1014	McGuinness et al., <i>Description Logic in Practice: A CLASSIC: Application</i> , Proceedings of the 14th International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence, Montreal, Canada, (August 1995)	
1015	Versata Complaint in the <i>Versata</i> lawsuit	
1016	Versata Counterclaim in the <i>Ford</i> lawsuit	

I, Deborah L. McGuinness, Ph.D., hereby declare as follows:

I. Introduction

1. I am making this declaration at the request of Ford Motor Company in a Covered Business Method Review proceeding concerning U.S. Patent No. 8,805,825 (“the ‘825 Patent”).

2. I am being compensated for my work in this matter at my standard consulting rate of \$500 per hour and, when working while traveling, \$600. My compensation does not depend on the outcome of this proceeding.

3. I have been asked to provide my opinion on the patentability of claims 1-20 of the ‘825 Patent.

4. In preparation of this declaration, I have studied Exhibits 1001 and 1006-1009 and 1011-1014 as listed in the Exhibit List shown above in my report.

5. In forming the opinions expressed below, I have considered:

(a) The patents and file histories identified in the List of Exhibits;

(b) The relevant legal standards as described to me by counsel, and any additional legal standards set forth in the body of this declaration; and

(c) My knowledge and experience based upon my work and study as described below, considering the patentability of the ‘825 Patent from the viewpoint of a person having ordinary skill in the relevant art as of the priority date of the ‘825 Patent, which I am told is January 12, 2005.

II. Qualifications and professional experience

6. I have provided my full background in the curriculum vitae that is attached as Ex. 1010, which more fully details my 30-plus years of experience in computer science and electrical engineering. I am also an inventor on five patents, four of which directly relate to product configuration: U.S. Patent Nos. 5,720,008, 5,974,405, 6,256,627, 6,385,600, and 6,457,002.

7. My academic training includes completing the requirements for a Bachelor of Science in Computer Science and a Bachelor of Arts in Mathematics from Duke University in 1980. I completed a Master of Science degree from the Electrical Engineering and Computer Science Department of the University of California at Berkeley in 1981. I also completed a Ph.D. in Computer Science from Rutgers University in 1996.

8. I began my professional career immediately after my Bachelor's degree and began work for AT&T Bell Laboratories in 1980. I was immediately accepted into the Bell Laboratories "One Year on Campus" program which supported me to be a full time Master's student at Berkeley. Upon completion of my M.S. in 1981, I returned to Bell Laboratories and began work at the Home of the Future at the Home Information Systems Laboratory. In 1984, I transferred to the Computing Environments and Artificial Intelligence Department in New Jersey. While there, I was accepted into the Bell Laboratories Ph.D. program,

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.