

[trials@uspto.gov](mailto:trials@uspto.gov)

CBM2015-00015, Paper No. 52  
CBM2015-00016, Paper No. 53  
CBM2015-00017, Paper No. 44  
CBM2014-00192, Paper No. 43  
CBM2014-00193, Paper No. 43  
CBM2014-00194, Paper No. 47  
CBM2014-00199, Paper No. 47  
CBM2015-00018, Paper No. 40

571-272-7822

December 10, 2015

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE  
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

-----

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC.,  
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., and APPLE INC.,

Petitioners,

v.

SMARTFLASH LLC,

Patent Owner.

-----

Case Nos. CBM2014-00192, CBM2015-00016

(Patent Number 8,033,458)

CBM2014-00193, CBM2015-00017

(Patent Number 8,061,598)

CBM2014-00194, CBM2014-00199, CBM2015-00015

(Patent Number 8,118,221)

CBM2015-00018, (Patent Number 7,942,317)

Oral Hearing Held on Monday, November 9, 2015

Before: JENNIFER S. BISK; RAMA G. ELLURU; JEREMY M. PLENZLER (via video link); and MATTHEW R. CLEMENTS (via video link), Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Monday, November 9, 2015, at 10:03 a.m., in Hearing Room A, taken at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER SAMSUNG:

W. KARL RENNER, ESQ.  
TOM ROZYLOWICZ, ESQ.  
ANDREW PATRICK, ESQ.  
YAO WANG, ESQ.  
Fish & Richardson P.C.  
1425 K Street, N.W., 11th Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
202-783-5070

Julie Han, Samsung Representative

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER APPLE:

J. STEVEN BAUGHMAN, ESQ.  
MEGAN F. RAYMOND, ESQ.  
Ropes & Gray LLP  
2099 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20006-6807  
202-508-4600

APPEARANCES (Continued)

JAMES R. BATCHELDER, ESQ.  
Ropes & Gray LLP  
1900 University Avenue  
Sixth Floor  
East Palo Alto, California 94303-2284  
650-617-4000

CHING-LEE FUKUDA, ESQ.  
Ropes & Gray LLP  
1211 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, New York 10036-8704  
212-596-9000

Cyndi Wheeler, Apple Representative

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

MICHAEL R. CASEY, ESQ.  
GREG KRAUSS, ESQ.  
Davidson Berquist Jackson & Gowdey LLP  
8300 Greensboro Drive  
Suite 500  
McLean, Virginia 22102  
571-765-7200

Case Nos. CBM2014-00192, CBM2015-00016 (Patent Number 8,033,458);  
CBM2014-00193, CBM2015-00017 (Patent Number 8,061,598);  
CBM2014-00194, CBM2014-00199, CBM2015-00015 (Patent Number  
8,118,221); and CBM2015-00018, (Patent Number 7,942,317)

P R O C E E D I N G S

(10:03 a.m.)

JUDGE ELLURU: Please be seated. Good  
morning. We are here for the final hearing in  
CBM2015-0015, CBM2015-0016, CBM2015-0017 and  
CBM2015-0018, Apple Inc. versus Smartflash LLC.

This is also the final hearing for CBM2014-00192,  
with which CBM2015-00119 has been consolidated;  
CBM2014-00193, with which CBM2015-00120 has been  
consolidated; CBM2014-00194, with which CBM2015-00117  
has been consolidated; and CBM2014-00199, Samsung  
Electronics America, Inc., Samsung Electronics Company,  
Limited, and Apple, Inc. v. Smartflash.

I'm Judge Elluru. To my right is Judge Bisk. And  
appearing remotely from San Jose is Judge Clements and from  
Detroit is Judge Plenzler.

Let's begin with appearances from counsel,  
starting with Petitioner Apple.

MR. BAUGHMAN: Your Honor, Steve Baughman.  
With me is my colleague, Jim Batchelder, Ching-Lee Fukuda  
and Megan Raymond for Apple. And we have with us a  
representative of apple, Cyndi Wheeler.

JUDGE ELLURU: Thank you. And for  
Smartflash?

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.