Page 77

Continued Deposition of BENJAMIN GOLDBERG, PH.D, held at the offices of Kaye Scholer, LLP, 250 West 55th Street, New York, New York, pursuant to Notice, before Joelle Falsetta, a Notary Public of the State of New York.

LARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

Page 78 APPEARANCES: 1 2 3 KAYE SCHOLER, LLP 4 Attorneys for Petitioner 250 West 55th Street 5 New York, New York 10019 6 7 BY: ROBERT LAURENZI, ESQ. 8 9 10 11 12 FITCH EVEN TABIN & FLANNERY, LLP 13 Attorneys for Patent owner 120 South LaSalle Street, Suite 201 14 15 Chicago, Illinois 60603 16 BY: TIMOTHY P. MALONEY, ESQ. 17 (Tim@fitcheven.com) 18 19 20 21 22 Also present via telephone: 23 Michael Franzinger, Apple 24 25

Δ

Benjamin Goldberg, Ph.D.

Page 79 BENJAMIN GOLDBERG, 1 2 being first duly sworn by Joelle Falsetta, a Notary Public of the State of 3 New York, was examined and testified as 4 follows: 5 6 0. Good morning, Dr. Goldberg. 7 A. Good morning. 8 Q. We met before at your 9 previous deposition; is that right? Α. Yes. 10 You still remember the 11 Ο. overall procedure of the deposition? 12 13 Α. I do, thank you. I'll skip through those 14 0. 15 formalities since you understand them. We only have a few documents 16 that I'll be asking you questions 17 about today. So I'll just hand you 18 19 them up front. 20 MR. MALONEY: Let me start by asking the court reporter to 21 22 mark as Exhibit 6 of this 23 deposition, a declaration of 24 Dr. Goldberg, dated December 21, 25 2015.

R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

```
Page 80
                 (Declaration marked for
 1
 2
      identification, Goldberg Exhibit
      6.)
 3
 4
               Do you recognize what has
           Q.
      been handed to you and marked as
 5
 6
      Goldberg 6 as your December 21st
 7
      declaration?
 8
           Α.
                Yes.
                Let me hand you what has
 9
           0.
      been previously marked at your prior
10
      deposition as Goldberg 2.
11
12
            Do you recognize that as the
      '280 Patent involved in this
13
      proceeding?
14
15
           A. Yes.
16
           0.
                And let me also hand you
17
      what has been marked as Goldberg
      Exhibit 3.
18
            Do you recognize that as the
19
      Stefik Patent in this proceeding?
20
21
           Α.
                Yes.
22
           O. I think most of my
      questions will be confined to those
23
24
      documents.
25
            So turning to Exhibit 6, your
```

CKEI A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

Page 81 second declaration. I read through 1 2 some of these additional examples that 3 you provided and I have some questions about those. 4 And I ask you to turn to page 5 6 four and the section beginning 7 paragraph nine, you have some discussion of an example of a set of, 8 9 two sets of usage rights that you set forth here in the table appearing in 10 11 paragraph nine; is that right? 12 Α. Yes. 13 0. Do you need time to familiarize yourself with what you 14 15 said here or are you comfortable 16 proceeding? 17 Α. We could proceed. I understand generally the 18 Ο. points you make. I just want to kind 19 of see where we can agree if at 20 21 anything. 22 And let me begin by just confirming what we have here in the 23 24 table. 25 Am I correct that what you are

R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

DOCKET A L A R M



Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.