

trials@uspto.gov

CBM2015-00031, Paper No. 43

CBM2015-00032, Paper No. 44

CBM2015-00033, Paper No. 38

571-272-7822

March 8, 2016

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING
UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,

Petitioner,

vs.

SMARTFLASH LLC,

Patent Owner.

CBM2015-00031

CBM2015-00032

CBM2015-00033

Patent 8,336,772

Technology Center 2800

Oral Hearing Held: Wednesday, January 6, 2016

Before: JENNIFER S. BISK; RAMA G. ELLURU; GREGG ANDERSON (via video link); and MATTHEW R. CLEMENTS (via video link); Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Wednesday, January 6, 2016, at 3:15 p.m., Hearing Room B, taken at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

REPORTED BY: RAYMOND G. BRYNTESON, RMR,
CRR, RDR

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER APPLE:

J. STEVEN BAUGHMAN, ESQ.
Ropes & Gray LLP
2099 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006-6807
202-508-4600

JAMES R. BATCHELDER, ESQ.
Ropes & Gray LLP
1900 University Avenue
Sixth Floor
East Palo Alto, California 94303-2284
650-617-4000

CYNDI WHEELER, ESQ. (via telephone)
Apple Representative

APPEARANCES: (Continued)

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER SAMSUNG:

W. KARL RENNER, ESQ.
THOMAS ROZYLOWICZ, ESQ.
Fish & Richardson P.C.
1425 K Street, N.W., 11th Floor
Washington, D.C. 20005
202-783-5070

JULIE HAN, ESQ. (via telephone)
Samsung Representative

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER GOOGLE:

ANDREW M. HOLMES, ESQ.
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP
50 California Street, 22nd Floor
San Francisco, California 94111
415-875-6322

APPEARANCES: (Continued)

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER GOOGLE:

PATRICK WESTON, ESQ.
Google
1600 Amphitheatre Parkway
Mountain View, California 94043
650-253-5416

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

MICHAEL R. CASEY, PH.D., ESQ.
Davidson Berquist Jackson & Gowdey LLP
8300 Greensboro Drive
Suite 500
McLean, Virginia 22102
571-765-7705

P R O C E E D I N G S

(3:15 p.m.)

JUDGE ELLURU: This is the final hearing for
CBM2015-00031, CBM2015-00032 and CBM2015-00033,
Apple Inc. against Smartflash LLC.

CBM2015-00059, Samsung Electronics America,
Inc. and Samsung Electronics Company Limited against
Smartflash LLC has been consolidated with these cases.
CBM2015-00132, Google, Inc. against Smartflash LLC, has
been consolidated with these cases.

I'm Judge Elluru, and to my right is Judge Bisk.
And appearing remotely from San Jose is Judge Clements and
from San Diego is Judge Anderson.

Let's begin with appearances of counsel starting
with Petitioner Apple.

MR. BAUGHMAN: Your Honor, Steve Baughman
and Jim Batchelder for Apple. With us on the phone is Cyndi
Wheeler. Thank you.

JUDGE ELLURU: Thank you. Petitioner
Samsung?

MR. RENNER: Your Honor, Karl Renner, and on
the phone is Julie Han, and Tom Rozyłowicz.

JUDGE ELLURU: Thank you. And Petitioner
Google?

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.