

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING  
UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

-----

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

-----

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., ET AL,

Petitioner,

vs.

SMARTFLASH LLC,

Patent Owner.

-----

CBM2014-00190 (Patent 7,334,720)  
Technology Center 2800

Oral Hearing Held: Wednesday, January 6, 2016

Before: JENNIFER S. BISK; RAMA G. ELLURU; GREGG  
ANDERSON (via video link); and MATTHEW R. CLEMENTS (via video  
link); Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Wednesday,  
January 6, 2016, at 1:35 p.m., Hearing Room B, taken at the U.S. Patent and  
Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

REPORTED BY: RAYMOND G. BRYNTESON, RMR,  
CRR, RDR

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER APPLE:

J. STEVEN BAUGHMAN, ESQ.  
Ropes & Gray LLP  
2099 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20006-6807  
202-508-4600

CYNDI WHEELER, ESQ. (via telephone)  
Apple Representative

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER SAMSUNG:

W. KARL RENNER, ESQ.  
THOMAS ROZYLOWICZ, ESQ.  
Fish & Richardson P.C.  
1425 K Street, N.W., 11th Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
202-783-5070

JULIE HAN, ESQ. (via telephone)  
Samsung Representative

APPEARANCES: (Continued)

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

MICHAEL R. CASEY, PH.D., ESQ.  
Davidson Berquist Jackson & Gowdey LLP  
8300 Greensboro Drive  
Suite 500  
McLean, Virginia 22102  
571-765-7705

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 (1:35 p.m.)

3 JUDGE ELLURU: This is the final hearing for  
4 CBM2014-00190, Samsung Electronics America, Inc. and  
5 Samsung Electronics Company Limited versus Smartflash  
6 LLC; CBM2015-00118, Apple Inc. against Smartflash LLC,  
7 which has been consolidated with this case.

8 I'm Judge Elluru. To my right is Judge Bisk. And  
9 appearing remotely from San Jose is Judge Clements and from  
10 San Diego is Judge Anderson.

11 Let's begin with appearances of counsel, starting  
12 with Petitioner Samsung, please.

13 MR. RENNER: Yes, Your Honor. This is Karl  
14 Renner, and with me is Tom Rozylowicz, and on the phone  
15 Julie Han.

16 JUDGE ELLURU: Thank you. For Petitioner  
17 Apple?

18 MR. BAUGHMAN: Your Honor, Steve Baughman  
19 from Ropes & Gray, and on the phone Cyndi Wheeler from  
20 Apple.

21 JUDGE ELLURU: And from Patent Owner?

22 MR. CASEY: Michael Casey, Your Honor, from  
23 Davidson Berquist Jackson & Gowdey on behalf of Patent  
24 Owner Smartflash.

1           JUDGE ELLURU: Thank you. Each party,  
2 Samsung and Smartflash, will have 15 minutes each of total  
3 time to present its arguments.

4           Petitioner Samsung has the burden so it will go  
5 first. Then Patent Owner Smartflash will argue its opposition  
6 to Petitioner's case and then, if Petitioner Samsung has  
7 reserved any time, Petitioner can use that time for rebuttal.

8           Please remember that Judges Clements and  
9 Anderson cannot see whatever is being projected on the  
10 screen. So when you refer to a demonstrative on the screen,  
11 please state the slide number so they are aware of which  
12 exhibit you are referring to. And also please identify the case  
13 number to which you are referring when you are referring to a  
14 particular case.

15           I will use the clock on the wall in the hearing room  
16 to time you and will give you a warning when you are reaching  
17 the end of your argument.

18           Mr. Renner, you may begin when you are ready.

19           MR. RENNER: I would like to reserve five  
20 minutes, Your Honor.

21           May it please the Board. I'm Karl Renner here on  
22 behalf of Samsung Corporation. This proceeding involves just  
23 two claims of the '720 patent, claims 13 and 14.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.