

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

SMARTFLASH LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case CBM2014-00102¹
Patent 8,118,221 B2

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

¹ Case CBM2014-00103 has been consolidated with the instant proceeding.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Petitioner’s Response To PO’s Statement Of Facts	3
II.	PO Incorrectly Interprets Petitioner’s Proposed Construction Of “Payment Data” And Ignores The Explicit Teachings Of The ’221 Patent	3
III.	PO Fails To Rebut The Obviousness Of Claims 1, 11, And 12 In View Of Stefik	5
	A. Stefik Discloses "Payment Data" (Claims 1, 11, and 12).....	5
	B. PO Does Not Rebut Evidence That ’235 Stefik and ’980 Stefik Render Obvious Retrieving Data “Responsive to Payment Validation Data” (Claims 1 and 11)	8
IV.	Petitioner Identified Multiple Embodiments Of “Data Carrier” In Stefik, Each Of Which Invalidates The Challenged Claims	10
V.	Po Fails To Rebut The Obviousness Of Claims 2, 13, And 14 In View Of Stefik And Poggio.....	11
	A. PO Does Not Dispute That It Would Have Been Obvious to Combine Stefik with Poggio	11
	B. The Combination of Stefik and Poggio Discloses Forwarding Payment Validation Data to a Data Supplier.....	11
VI.	Ginter Renders Obvious The Payment Limitations Of The Challenged Claims	13
	A. Pre-Purchase Processing Does Not Change the Principle of Operation of Ginter	14
	B. Ginter Discloses Multiple Examples of “Payment Data”	16
	C. Ginter Discloses “Payment Validation Data”	18
VII.	Ginter Renders Obvious Forwarding Payment Validation Data To A Data Supplier.....	19
VIII.	Mr. Wechselberger’s Opinions Are Entitled To Far Greater Weight Than Dr. Katz’s	20

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Extreme Networks, Inc. v. Enterasys Networks, Inc.</i> , 395 F. App'x 709 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	20
<i>Flex-Rest, LLC v. Steelcase, Inc.</i> , 455 F.3d 1351 (Fed. Cir. 2006)	21
<i>In re Ratti</i> , 270 F.2d 810 (C.C.P.A. 1959)	16
<i>Sundance, Inc. v. DeMonte Fabricating Ltd.</i> , 550 F.3d 1356 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	21

LIST OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,118,221
1002	Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint
1003	File History for U.S. Patent No. 8,061,598
1004	File History for U.S. Patent No. 8,336,772
1005	U.S. Patent No. 5,675,734
1006	U.S. Patent No. 4,999,806
1007	U.S. Patent No. 4,878,245
1008	U.S. Patent No. 7,344,720
1009	U.S. Patent No. 7,942,317
1010	U.S. Patent No. 5,754,654
1011	File History for U.S. Patent No. 8,118,221
1012	U.S. Patent No. 5,103,392
1013	U.S. Patent No. 5,530,235
1014	U.S. Patent No. 5,629,980
1015	U.S. Patent No. 5,915,019
1016	European Patent Application, Publication No. EP0809221A2
1017	PCT Application Publication No. WO99/43136
1018	JP Patent Application Publication No. H11-164058 (translation)
1019	JP Patent Application Publication No. H10-269289 (translation)

Exhibit	Description
1020	Eberhard von Faber, Robert Hammelrath, and Peter Heider, "The Secure Distribution of Digital Contents," IEEE (1997)
1021	Declaration of Anthony J. Wechselberger In Support of Apple Inc.'s Petition for Covered Business Method Patent Review
1022	Declaration of Michael P. Duffey In Support of Apple Inc.'s Petition for Covered Business Method Patent Review
1023	Declaration of Flora D. Elias-Mique In Support of Apple Inc.'s Petition for Covered Business Method Patent Review
1024	U.S. Patent No. 8,033,458
1025	U.S. Patent No. 8,061,598
1026	U.S. Patent No. 8,336,772
1027	File History for U.S. Patent No. 7,334,720
1028	File History for U.S. Patent No. 7,942,317
1029	File History for U.S. Patent No. 8,033,458
1030	Wechselberger Transcript Excerpts
1031	Katz Deposition Transcript
1032	Declaration of Michael P. Duffey

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.