

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

DELL INC.
Petitioner

v.

DISPOSITION SERVICES LLC
Patent Owner

Case CBM2013-00040
Patent 5,424,944

Before SALLY C. MEDLEY, KEVIN F. TURNER, and
MATTHEW R. CLEMENTS, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

CLEMENTS, *Administrative Patent Judge*.

SCHEDULING ORDER

A. DUE DATES

This order sets due dates for the parties to take action in this trial. The parties may stipulate to different dates for DUE DATES 1 through 3 (earlier or later, but no later than DUE DATE 4). A notice of the stipulation, specifically identifying the changed due dates, must be promptly filed. The parties may not stipulate to an extension of DUE DATES 4-7.

In stipulating to different times, the parties should consider the effect of the stipulation on times to object to evidence (37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1)), to supplement evidence (37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(2)), to conduct cross-examination (37 C.F.R. § 42.53(d)(2)), and to draft papers depending on the evidence and cross-examination testimony (see section B, below).

The parties are reminded that the Testimony Guidelines appended to the Office Patent Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48,756, 48,772 (Aug. 14, 2012) (Appendix D), apply to this trial. The Board may impose an appropriate sanction for failure to adhere to the Testimony Guidelines. 37 C.F.R. § 42.12. For example, reasonable expenses and attorneys' fees incurred by any party may be levied on a person who impedes, delays, or frustrates the fair examination of a witness.

1. DUE DATE 1

The patent owner may file—

- a. A response to the petition (37 C.F.R. § 42.120), and
- b. A motion to amend the patent (37 C.F.R. § 42.121).

The patent owner must file any such response or motion to amend by DUE DATE 1. If the patent owner elects not to file anything, the patent

CBM2013-00040
Patent 5,424,944

owner must arrange a conference call with the parties and the Board. The patent owner is cautioned that any arguments for patentability not raised in the response will be deemed waived.

2. DUE DATE 2

The petitioner must file any reply to the patent owner's response and opposition to the motion to amend by DUE DATE 2.

3. DUE DATE 3

The patent owner must file any reply to the petitioner's opposition to patent owner's motion to amend by DUE DATE 3.

4. DUE DATE 4

a. Each party must file any motion for an observation on the cross-examination testimony of a reply witness (see section C, below) by DUE DATE 4.

b. Each party must file any motion to exclude evidence (37 C.F.R. § 42.64(c)) and any request for oral argument (37 C.F.R. § 42.70(a)) by DUE DATE 4.

5. DUE DATE 5

a. Each party must file any reply to an observation on cross-examination testimony by DUE DATE 5.

b. Each party must file any opposition to a motion to exclude evidence by DUE DATE 5.

6. DUE DATE 6

Each party must file any reply in support of a motion to exclude evidence by DUE DATE 6.

7. DUE DATE 7

The oral argument (if requested by either party) is set for DUE DATE 7.

B. CROSS-EXAMINATION

Except as the parties might otherwise agree, for each due date—

1. Cross-examination begins after any supplemental evidence is due. 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.53(d)(2).

2. Cross-examination ends no later than a week before the filing date for any paper in which the cross-examination testimony is expected to be used. *Id.*

C. MOTION FOR OBSERVATION ON CROSS-EXAMINATION

A motion for observation on cross-examination provides the petitioner with a mechanism to draw the Board's attention to relevant cross-examination testimony of a reply witness, since no further substantive paper is permitted after the reply. *See* Office Patent Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48,756, 48,768 (Aug. 14, 2012). The observation must be a concise statement of the relevance of precisely identified testimony to a precisely identified argument or portion of an exhibit. Each observation should not exceed a single, short paragraph. The patent owner may respond to the observation. Any response must be equally concise and specific.

CBM2013-00040
Patent 5,424,944

DUE DATE APPENDIX

- DUE DATE 1..... May 6, 2014
 Patent owner’s response to the petition
 Patent owner’s motion to amend the patent
- DUE DATE 2..... August 6, 2014
 Petitioner’s reply to patent owner response to petition
 Petitioner’s opposition to motion to amend
- DUE DATE 3.....September 8, 2014
 Patent owner’s reply to petitioner opposition to motion to
 amend
- DUE DATE 4.....September 29, 2014
 Motion for observation regarding
 cross-examination of reply witness
 Motion to exclude evidence
 Request for oral argument
- DUE DATE 5.....October 14, 2014
 Response to observation
 Opposition to motion to exclude
- DUE DATE 6.....October 20, 2014
 Reply to opposition to motion to exclude
- DUE DATE 7.....November 4, 2014
 Oral argument (if requested)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.