

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE CO.

Petitioner

v.

PROGRESSIVE CASUALTY INSURANCE CO.

Patent Owner

Case CBM2012-00003

Patent 8,140,358

Before the Honorable JAMESON LEE, JONI Y. CHANG, and MICHAEL R. ZECHER, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

**REBUTTAL DECLARATION OF MARY L. O'NEIL ON BEHALF OF
PETITIONER LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE CO. REGARDING U.S.
PATENT NO. 8,140,358**

I, Mary L. O'Neil, hereby declare under penalty of perjury:

I. Qualifications

1. I am currently Principal of O'Neil Consulting Services, Inc. (OCS), an independent actuarial consulting practice, which I established in 1986. I have over 30 years experience as a property casualty actuary in the insurance industry. My CV is attached as Ex. 1033.

2. OCS provides actuarial consulting services to a variety of clients from both the regulatory and private sectors. For example, the regulatory agencies in which

I have provided consulting services include the North Carolina Department of Insurance (for which I have completed Private Passenger Automobile rate analyses for more than twenty years), the New Jersey Department of Insurance, the New York Department of Insurance, the Ontario Automobile Insurance Board, the Texas Office of Public Insurance Counsel, the Georgia Department of Insurance, the Pennsylvania Department of Insurance, and the Wyoming Department of Environmental Quality.

3. Individual insurers or insurance pools for which I have provided consulting services include Integrity Insurance Company in Liquidation (on behalf of liquidator), Home State Holdings, Inc. in Liquidation (on behalf of liquidator), Security Indemnity Insurance Company in Rehabilitation (on behalf of rehabilitator), Pennsylvania Millers Mutual Insurance Company, several small insurers, and several self-insurance pools.

4. The services I have performed on behalf of OCS include analysis of proposed rates by insurers, analysis of required insurer reserves in conjunction with regulatory examinations of insurance companies, evaluation of loss reserves for purposes of reinsurance commutation, preparation of required reserve opinions for individual insurers and pools, evaluation of legislation, and other special projects.

5. Rate analyses have included private passenger automobile, homeowners', dwelling fire, title, and workers' compensation. These projects have been completed

for individual rate filings or full industry rate filings in selected states. I have also estimated the required loss and loss adjustment expense reserves for a multibillion dollar multi-line insurer group, a number of insurers in conjunction with financial examinations, for purposes of commutations, several small insurers, and self-insurance pools. These analyses have sometimes addressed the issues of mass torts or catastrophes.

6. My previous work experience includes insurance actuary positions at the New Department of Insurance (“NJDOI”), Prudential Property and Casualty Insurance Company, and General Reinsurance Corporation.

7. During my nearly two years at NJDOI, I served as the Department’s Chief Actuary. My responsibilities included supervision of the actuarial aspects of regulation for all lines of insurance: personal lines and commercial lines rates and forms, life contracts and health rates. In addition, I supervised the life valuations and supplied assistance to the Examinations Division in valuing property/casualty insurer reserves. I also served as an advisor to the commissioner and other department staff on all issues before the department.

8. For the eleven years I worked at Prudential, I had a variety of responsibilities, which included insurance pricing, marketing, reserving, financial analysis, and various special projects. I started as an actuarial student and rose to the

level of Vice President and Assistant Actuary. Finally, at General Reinsurance Corporation, I spent one year doing mostly statistical insurance work.

9. I have also worked with several law firms in a consulting and/or expert capacity. My attached CV lists all the matters in which I was involved, including my testimonial experience. *See* Ex. 1033.

10. I have the professional designations of Fellow of the Casualty Actuarial Society (FCAS), Member of the American Academy of Actuaries (MAAA), Chartered Life Underwriter (CLU), and Chartered Financial Consultant (ChFC). I am also a member of the Casualty Actuarial Society (CAS), American Academy of Actuaries (AAA), and the International Association of Insurance Receivers (IAIR).

11. My education includes a B.S. in Mathematics from Pennsylvania State University, and an M.A. in Statistics, also from Pennsylvania State University.

12. I have been retained on behalf of Petitioner and real party in interest, Liberty Mutual Insurance Company (“Ppetitioner” or “Liberty Mutual”), I have been asked by Liberty Mutual to respond to certain assertions and opinions offered by Michael Miller and Progressive Casualty Insurance Co. (“Progressive”) concerning U.S. Patent No. 8,140,358 (“the ‘358 patent”) in this matter.

13. I am being compensated at a rate of \$500 per hour for my services, after expert service fees. My compensation does not depend on the outcome of this

Business Method Review Petition or the pending litigation between Petitioner and Progressive in the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Ohio.

II. Scope of Rebuttal Declaration

14. I have been asked to respond to certain assertions and opinions of Mr. Michael Miller expressed in his declaration of June 12, 2013 as Exhibit 2005, his supplemental declaration of June 26, 2013 as Exhibit 2013, and certain assertions of Progressive in its Patent Owner's Response of June 12, 2013.

15. In developing my opinions below, I have considered the following materials:

- Declaration of Michael Miller (Ex. 2005);
- Supplemental Declaration of Michael Miller (Ex. 2013);
- Patent Owner's Response (Paper 33) ("Opposition" or "Opp.");
- Board's Decision on Institution of Covered Business Method Review (Paper 15);
- Progressive's U.S. Patent No. 8,140,358 ("the '358 Patent") (Ex. 1001);
- United States Patent Application Publication No. 2002/0128882 ("Nakagawa") (Ex. 1005);
- United States Patent Application No. 09/571,650 ("the '650 Application") (Ex. 2004);

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.