	Trial: Day 01 Vol. B Carter cross, redirect, Dholakia direct, cross, redirect 8/17/2009 1:16:00 PM
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
	FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
2	MARSHALL DIVISION
3	VERSATA SOFTWARE, INC. * Civil Docket No.
	* 2:07-CV-153
4	VS. * Marshall, Texas
	*
5	* August 17, 2009
	SAP AMERICA INC., ET AL * 1:15 P.M.
6	
	TRANSCRIPT OF TRIAL
7	BEFORE THE HONORABLE CHAD EVERINGHAM
	UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE
8	AND A JURY
9	APPEARANCES:
10	FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: MR. SAM BAXTER
	McKool-Smith
11	104 East Houston, Suite 300
	Marshall, TX 75670
12	
	MR. THEODORE STEVENSON, III
13	McKool-Smith
	300 Crescent Court, Suite 1500
14	Dallas, TX 75201
15	MR. SCOTT COLE
	MR. STEVEN J. POLLINGER
16	MS. LAURIE L. GALLUN
	MR. JOSH W. BUDWIN
17	MR. KEVIN M. KNEUPPER
	McKool-Smith
18	300 West 6th Street, Suite 1700
	Austin, TX 787011
19	ADDEAD ANGEO CONTINUED ON MEYT DAGE
20	APPEARANCES CONTINUED ON NEXT PAGE:
21	COURT DEPORTEDO: MC CUCAN CIMACNO COR
22	COURT REPORTERS: MS. SUSAN SIMMONS, CSR
22	MS. JUDITH WERLINGER, CSR
72	Official Court Reporters
23	100 East Houston, Suite 125
24	Marshall, TX 75670 903/935-3868
24 25	(Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography,
20	tracecunings recorded by mechanical sterlography,

VERSATA v. SAP

Unsigned **A001168** 

VERSATA EXHIBIT 2010



- 1 is a business person that is responsible for setting
- 2 pricing in a way that's going to help his company or her
- 3 company sell the most of their products and earn the
- 4 most amount of money in profit.
- 5 Q. Okay. And when you were selling your software
- 6 and trying to pitch it --
- 7 A. Yeah.
- 8 Q. -- was that person your target audience?
- 9 A. Initially, it was.
- 10 Q. Well, pretend I'm a pricing manager and I'm at
- 11 a big company that does a lot of complex promotions and
- 12 I'm currently involved -- I've got SAP or Oracle or one
- 13 of the big ERP enterprise software --
- 14 A. Right.
- 15 Q. -- programs running in my shop, and it's got
- 16 that pricing module we've talked about. And pretend
- 17 you've run into me, and this is a golden opportunity for
- 18 you to tell me your best pitch why Trilogy's Pricer is
- 19 better than what I've got now that I don't have to pay
- 20 anything more for.
- 21 What would you tell me?
- A. I'll give it my best shot.
- 23 From what I remember, we used to focus on
- 24 three things. We would say, quickly, ease of
- 25 maintenance. The programs that I just described with

VERSATA v. SAP

Unsigned **A001277** 



- 1 our system, you, pricing manager, can do yourself. You
- 2 won't have to go ask somebody in IT to do it for you.
- No. 2 was disconnected pricing. You want to
- 4 be able to put the power of that pricing information out
- 5 onto a laptop computer with your sales rep in front of
- 6 the customer, not have it locked up back at
- 7 headquarters.
- 8 And No. 3, I would have said performance.
- 9 It's performance, fast. The calculations are going to
- 10 come back like that (snaps fingers) because of the way
- 11 the system was designed.
- 12 Q. Okay. I wrote these down. I want to ask you
- 13 some questions about them.
- 14 A. Okay.
- Q. The first, I saw you said ease of maintenance,
- 16 and you don't have to involve IT.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. IT, is that information —
- 19 A. Information technology, yes.
- Q. That's the department in most companies that
- 21 does what?
- 22 A. They're responsible for the computers and the
- 23 software and the systems that run the business.
- Q. So under the old way of doing it, before
- 25 Trilogy comes along, if I'm the price manager --

VERSATA v. SAP

Unsigned **A001278** 



- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. -- and I want to do this snow tire promotion
- 3 in the Northeast --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. -- what is my life like?
- 6 A. Frustrating, because you have to -- you've
- 7 designed a promotion to respond in real time to this
- 8 situation. You're losing to Michelin in the Northeast
- 9 on the snow tires.
- 10 But you have to call somebody over in IT,
- 11 usually fill out a form that describes the promotion you
- 12 want to have run.
- 13 Q. Wait a second. Why can't I get on my computer
- 14 on my desk? I've got the stem-to-stern software, and
- 15 type in my promotion right here and just do it?
- 16 A. If you saw some of the screens before, SAP's
- 17 user interface is not exactly designed for the pricing
- 18 manager to know condition types and the like.
- 19 Q. Would I have to get into tables and create
- 20 those?
- 21 A. That's right.
- Q. Most of the companies you dealt with, when you
- 23 were selling Pricer, would they funnel that off to their
- 24 IT departments?
- A. Correct.

VERSATA v. SAP

Unsigned **A001279** 



- 1 Q. And are those the same IT departments that
- 2 would be taking phone calls from people when their
- 3 computers crashed or responding to other emergencies?
- 4 A. Same group and the same group that was trying
- 5 to install other systems. They were typically the poor
- 6 souls that were overburdened and under resources
- 7 universally.
- 8 Q. So as the pricing manager, you come and tell
- 9 me you don't have to send your price promotions to IT
- 10 anymore, how big a deal is that to me?
- 11 A. That's huge.
- 12 Q. Why?
- 13 A. Because now you can get what promotion you
- 14 wanted to run to compete against Michelin, and you can
- 15 do it yourself in literally seconds or minutes versus
- 16 what would otherwise take days, weeks, months.
- 17 Q. The second thing I wrote down that you
- 18 mentioned was a disconnected --
- 19 A. Disconnected pricing.
- 20 Q. Is that basically you can run this on a
- 21 laptop?
- 22 A. That's right.
- Q. Okay. This may be fairly self-explanatory,
- 24 but just tell us why that's important.
- 25 A. Because prior to that -- you know, imagine if

VERSATA v. SAP

Unsigned **A001280** 



# DOCKET A L A R M

# Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

# **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### **LAW FIRMS**

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### **FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS**

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

### **E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS**

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

