

**SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF NEW YORK**

-----X	:	
	:	
AT LAST SPORTSWEAR, INC.,	:	Index No. 654327/2022
	:	
Plaintiff,	:	(Hon. Robert R. Reed)
	:	Part 43
-against-	:	
	:	
LESLIE BYRON,	:	
	:	
Defendant.	:	
	:	
-----X	:	

**REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF
DEFENDANT’S MOTION TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF’S COMPLAINT**

LOEB & LOEB LLP
John Piskora
345 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10154
Tel: (212) 407-4082

*Attorneys for Defendant
Leslie Byron*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	ii
PRELIMINARY STATEMENT	1
ARGUMENT	3
I. PLAINTIFFS’ STATE LAW CLAIMS ARE PREEMPTED BY THE COPYRIGHT ACT.....	3
II. PLAINTIFF’S STATE LAW CLAIMS ARE OTHERWISE INSUFFICIENTLY PLEADED AND BARRED BY THE INDISPUTABLE DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE.....	5
A. ALS’s Breach of Contract Claim Must be Dismissed	5
B. ALS’s Breach of Fiduciary Duty, Unfair Competition, Misappropriation, and Conversion Claims Are Duplicative and Should Be Dismissed	7
C. ALS’s Breach of Fiduciary Duty, Unfair Competition, Misappropriation, and Conversion Claims Should Be Dismissed For Failure to State a Cause of Action.....	8
CONCLUSION.....	11

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<u><i>Aetna Health Plans v. Hanover Ins. Co.</i></u> , 116 A.D.3d 538 (1st Dep't 2014), <i>aff'd</i> , <u>27 N.Y.3d 577</u> (2016).....	6
<u><i>Ahead Realty LLC v. India House, Inc.</i></u> , 92 A.D.3d 424 (1st Dep't 2012)	9
<u><i>Alloy Advisory v. 503 W. 33rd St. Assoc.</i></u> , 195 A.D.3d 436 (1st Dep't 2021)	6
<u><i>Apogee Handcraft, Inc. v. Verragio, Ltd.</i></u> , 155 A.D.3d 494 (1st Dep't 2017)	9
<u><i>Ardis Health, LLC v. Nankivell</i></u> , No. 11 Civ. 5013 (NRB), 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 154839 (S.D.N.Y Oct. 23, 2012)	5
<u><i>Barclays Capital Inc. v. Theflyonthewall.com, Inc.</i></u> , 650 F.3d 876 (2d Cir. 2011).....	5
<u><i>Beep Iams v. 10X Mgmt. LLC</i></u> , No. 656266/2019, 2020 N.Y. Misc. LEXIS 2557 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Cnty. May 29, 2020).....	5
<u><i>Besen v. Farhadian</i></u> , 195 A.D.3d 548 (1st Dep't 2021)	9
<u><i>Burry v Madison Park Owner LLC</i></u> , 84 A.D.3d 699 (1st Dep't 2011)	7
<u><i>Clavin v. CAP Equip. Leasing Corp.</i></u> , 156 A.D.3d 404 (1st Dep't 2017)	6, 7
<u><i>Connaughton v. Chipotle Mexican Grill, Inc.</i></u> , 29 N.Y.3d 137 (2017)	10
<u><i>D. Penguin Bros. Ltd. v City Natl. Bank</i></u> , 158 A.D.3d 432 (1st Dep't 2018)	9
<u><i>Editorial Photocolor Archives, Inc. v. Granger Collection</i></u> , 61 N.Y.2d 517 (1984)	3, 5

<u><i>Fin. Info., Inc. v. Moody's Investors Serv.</i></u> , 808 F.2d 204 (2d Cir. 1986).....	5
<u><i>Flag Wharf, Inc. v. Merrill Lynch Capital Corp.</i></u> , 40 A.D.3d 506 (1st Dep't 2007)	6
<u><i>Godfrey v. Spano</i></u> , 13 N.Y.3d 358 (2009)	10
<u><i>H2O Swimwear, Ltd. v. Lomas</i></u> , 164 A.D.2d 804 (1st Dep't 1990)	4
<u><i>Hertz Corp. v. Avis, Inc.</i></u> , 106 A.D.2d 246 (1st Dep't 1985)	10
<u><i>Indeck Energy Servs., Inc. v. Merced Capital, L.P.</i></u> , 200 A.D.3d 455 (1st Dep't 2021)	8
<u><i>Leonard v. Gateway II, LLC</i></u> , 68 A.D.3d 408 (1st Dep't 2009)	6
<u><i>Linkable Networks, Inc. v. Mastercard Inc.</i></u> , 184 A.D.3d 418 (1st Dep't 2020)	7
<u><i>MatlinPatterson ATA Holdings LLC v. Fed. Express Corp.</i></u> , 87 A.D.3d 836 (1st Dep't 2011)	8
<u><i>Maurizio v. Rendal</i></u> , 222 A.D.2d 281 (1st Dep't 1995)	5
<u><i>MBL Life Assur. Corp. v. 555 Realty Co.</i></u> , 240 A.D.2d 375 (2d Dep't 1997)	8
<u><i>Meyers v. Fabrics</i></u> , 65 N.Y.2d 75 (1985)	1, 3
<u><i>MLGenius Holdings LLC v. Google LLC</i></u> , No. 20-3113, 2022 U.S. App. LEXIS 6206 (2d Cir. Mar. 10, 2022).....	5
<u><i>Murphy v. Kozłowska</i></u> , No. 150978/2022, 2022 N.Y. Misc. LEXIS 5923 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Cnty. Sept. 2, 2022)	9
<u><i>Pergament v. Roach</i></u> , 41 A.D.3d 569 (2d Dep't 2007).....	7
<u><i>Retty Fin., Inc. v. Morgan Stanley Dean Witter & Co.</i></u> , 293 A.D.2d 341 (1st Dep't 2002)	8

Richbell Info. Servs. v. Jupiter Partners, L.P.,
309 A.D.2d 288 (1st Dep’t 2003)7, 8

Richstone v. Bd. of Mgrs. of Leighton House Condo.,
158 A.D.3d 551 (1st Dep’t 2018)6

Saulsbury v. Durfee,
201 A.D.3d 1318 (4th Dep’t 2022).....8

Schroeder v. Cohen,
169 A.D.3d 412 (1st Dep’t 2019)9

Shapiro v. Ninah Consulting, Inc.,
No. 654333/2018, 2019 N.Y. Misc. LEXIS 4530
(Sup. Ct. N.Y. Cnty. Aug. 16, 2019)6

Shir Capital, LLC v Fortress Credit Advisors LLC,
No. 160069/2019, 2020 N.Y. Misc. LEXIS 2664
(Sup. Ct. N.Y. Cnty. June 11, 2020).....9

We Shall Overcome Found. v. Richmond Org., Inc.,
221 F. Supp. 3d 396 (S.D.N.Y 2016).....5

William Kaufman Org., Ltd. v. Graham & James LLP,
269 A.D.2d 171 (1st Dep’t 2000)7

Statutes

17 U.S.C. § 106.....3, 4

17 U.S.C. § 301.....1, 3

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.