

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page(s)</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. BACKGROUND FACTS	2
A. T-Rex’s Prior Actions	3
B. BroadSign’s Allegations of Invalidity	4
C. BroadSign’s Allegations of Non-Infringement	5
D. BroadSign’s Allegations of Intervening Rights.....	8
III. LEGAL STANDARDS	9
IV. ARGUMENT	10
A. Invalidity Has Been Sufficiently Alleged	10
B. Non-infringement Has Been Sufficiently Alleged.....	15
C. Equitable Intervening Rights Has Been Sufficiently Alleged.....	18
D. If the Court Determines That the SAC is Not Sufficiently Detailed, BroadSign Should Be Granted Leave to Amend.....	19
V. CONCLUSION	20

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Advanced Cardiovascular Sys. v. Scimed Life Sys., Inc.</i> , 988 F.2d 1157 (Fed. Cir. 1993).....	15
<i>Alice Corp. Pty. Ltd. v. CLS Bank Int’l</i> , 134 S. Ct. 2347 (2014)	16, 17, 21
<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> , 556 U.S. 662 (2009)	7, 16, 18
<i>Aster Graphics, Inc. v. Static Control Components, Inc.</i> , No. CV 17-1167-DOC (JDEx) (C.D. Cal. Feb. 12 2018)	24
<i>BIC Leisure Products, Inc. v. Windsurfing Inter., Inc.</i> , 1 F.3d 1214 (Fed. Cir. 1993)	24
<i>Cardigan Mountain School v. New Hampshire Insurance Co.</i> , 787 F.3d 82 (1st Cir. 2015).....	15
<i>Chou v. University of Chicago</i> , 254 F.3d 1347 (Fed. Cir. 2001).....	16
<i>Comcast Cable Commc’ns, LLC v. OpenTV, Inc.</i> , 319 F.R.D. 269 (N.D. Cal. 2017).....	24
<i>Crye Precision LLC v. Duro Textiles, LLC</i> , 112 F. Supp. 3d 69 (S.D.N.Y. 2015).....	19
<i>CryoLife, Inc. v. C.R. Bard, Inc.</i> , No. CV 14-559-SLR, 2015 WL 1069397 (D. Del. Mar. 10, 2015)	18
<i>Disc Disease Sols Inc. v. VGH Sols, Inc.</i> , 888 F.3d 1256 (Fed. Cir. 2018).....	22
<i>Elan Pharma Int’l Ltd. v. Lupin Ltd.</i> , No. 09-1008 (JAG), 2010 WL 1372316 (D.N.J. Mar. 31, 2010)	19
<i>Gradient Enterprises, Inc. v. Skype Techs. S.A.</i> , 932 F. Supp. 2d 447 (W.D.N.Y. 2013)	18
<i>Graphic Packaging Int’l, Inc. v. C.W. Zumbiel Co.</i> , No. 1:10-cv-3008-AT, 2011 WL 5829674 (N.D. Ga. Aug. 1, 2011)	18

Halebian v. Bery,
644 F.3d 122 (2d Cir. 2011) 15

Helperich Patent Licensing, LLC v. J.C Penney Corp.,
No. 11 CV 9143, 2012 WL 3776892 (N.D. Ill. Aug. 28, 2012)..... 18

Holotouch, Inc. v. Microsoft Corp.,
No. 17 CIV. 8717 (AKH), 2018 WL 2290701 (S.D.N.Y. May 18, 2018)..... 18

Hon Hai Precision Indus. Co. v. WiLAN, Inc.,
12-cv-7900-SAS, 2013 WL 2322675 (S.D.N.Y. May 28, 2013) 26

L.M. Sessler Excavating & Wrecking, Inc. v. Bette & Cring, LLC,
No. 16-CV-06534-FPG, 2017 WL 4652709 (W.D.N.Y. Oct. 17, 2017) 18

Marine Polymer Techs., Inc. v. HemCon, Inc.,
659 F.3d 1084 (Fed. Cir. 2011), *opinion vacated on other grounds*, 672 F.3d
1350 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 25

Nalco Co. v. Chem-Mod, LLC,
883 F.3d 1337 (Fed. Cir. 2018)..... 15

Pfizer Inc. v. Apotex Inc.,
726 F. Supp. 2d 921 (N.D. Ill. 2010) 18

Presidio Components, Inc. v. Am. Tech. Ceramics Corp.,
No. 14-CV-2061-H (BGS), 2016 WL 7319533 (S.D. Cal. Feb. 10, 2016)..... 25

Summers Mfg. Co., Inc. v. Tri-Cty.,
300 F. Supp. 3d 1025 (S.D. Iowa 2017)..... 19, 24

T-Rex Property AB v. Health Media Network, LLC,
Case No. 1:16-cv-05673 (N.D. Ill. May 27, 2016) 9, 10, 20

Teirstein v. AGA Med. Corp.,
No. 6:08cv14, 2009 WL 704138 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 16, 2009) 19

Visual Memory LLC v. NVIDIA Corp.,
867 F.3d 1253 (Fed. Cir. 2017)..... 15

Wireless Ink Corp. v. Facebook, Inc.,
787 F. Supp. 2d 298 (S.D.N.Y. 2011) 19, 20

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 101..... 8, 17, 21

35 U.S.C. §102..... 16, 17

35 U.S.C. § 103..... 16, 17
35 U.S.C. § 112..... 16, 17
35 U.S.C. § 252..... 14, 15, 25

Other Authorities

5A Fed. Prac. & Proc. Civ. § 1327 (3d ed.) 10
Fed. R. Civ. P. 10(c)..... 10
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(2) 22
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6)..... 7, 15
Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a)..... 26
Rule 8 18, 19
Rule 12 18

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.