

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

	x	
BROADSIGN INTERNATIONAL, LLC,	:	
	:	
Plaintiff,	:	Civil Action No.: 1:16-cv-04586 (LTS)
	:	
v.	:	JURY TRIAL REQUESTED
	:	
T-REX PROPERTY AB,	:	
	:	
Defendant.	:	
	x	

**PLAINTIFF BROADSIGN INTERNATIONAL, LLC'S  
MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN OPPOSITION  
TO DEFENDANT T-REX PROPERTY AB'S  
MOTION TO DISMISS THE AMENDED COMPLAINT**

Alfred R. Fabricant (AF8255)  
Lawrence C. Drucker (LD9423)  
BROWN RUDNICK LLP  
7 Times Square  
New York, NY 10036  
Telephone: (212) 209-4800  
Facsimile: (212) 209-4801  
[afabricant@brownrudnick.com](mailto:afabricant@brownrudnick.com)  
[ldrucker@brownrudnick.com](mailto:ldrucker@brownrudnick.com)

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
BroadSign International, LLC

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION..... 1

II. STATEMENT OF THE FACTS ..... 4

III. LEGAL STANDARDS ..... 5

IV. ARGUMENT ..... 7

    A.    T-Rex and BroadSign are Engaged in an Actual, Direct  
        Dispute ..... 7

    B.    An Actual Controversy Arises from T-Rex's Suits Against BroadSign's  
        Customers Accusing BroadSign's Products of Infringement..... 10

        1. BroadSign Has Been Subject to Claims for Indemnification  
           From its Customers ..... 10

        2. BroadSign is Subject to a Claim of Indirect Infringement by T-Rex ..... 11

    C.    If BroadSign's Allegations are Deemed Insufficient,  
        Leave to Amend Should be Granted ..... 12

VI. CONCLUSION ..... 12

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**Page(s)**

**Cases**

*ABB Ins. v. Cooper Indus., LLC*,  
635 F. 3d 1345 (Fed. Cir. 2011)..... 8, 11

*Arkema Inc. v. Honeywell International, Inc.*,  
706 F. 3d 1351 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....*passim*

*Arris Grp., Inc. v. British Telecommunications PLC*,  
639 F.3d 1368 (Fed. Cir. 2011)..... 9

*Ass'n for Molecular Pathology v. U.S. Patent & Trademark Office*,  
689 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2012), *aff'd* ..... 7

*Cedars–Sinai Med. Ctr. v. Watkins*,  
11 F.3d 1573 (Fed.Cir.1993)..... 6

*Diamonds.net LLC v. IDEX Online, Ltd.*,  
590 F. Supp. 2d 593 (S.D.N.Y. 2008)..... 7

*Frederick Goldman, Inc. v. W.*,  
No. 06-CV-3413-LTS-RLE, 2007 WL 1989291 (S.D.N.Y. July 6, 2007)..... 10

*Golden Trade, S.r.L. v. Jordache*,  
143 F.R.D. 504 (S.D. N.Y. 1992) ..... 11

*Hon Hai Precision Indus. Co. v. Wi-LAN, Inc.*,  
12-cv-7900-SAS, 2013 WL 2322675 (S.D.N.Y. May 28, 2013) ..... 12

*MedImmune Ass'n for Molecular Pathology v. Myriad Genetics, Inc.*,  
133 S. Ct. 2107, 186 L. Ed. 2d 124 (2013)..... 7

*MedImmune Inc. v. Genentech Inc.*,  
549 U.S. 118 (2007)..... 6, 8

*Micron Tech., Inc. v. Mosaid Techs., Inc.*,  
518 F.3d 897 (Fed. Cir. 2008)..... 6, 8

*Microsoft Corp. v. Datatarn, Inc.*,  
755 F. 3d 899 (Fed. Cir. 2014)..... 10

*SanDisk Corp. v. STMicroelectronics, Inc.*,  
480 F.3d 1372 (Fed. Cir. 2007)..... 6, 7, 8

*Sony Elecs., Inc. v. Guardian Media Techs., Ltd.*,  
497 F.3d 1271 (Fed. Cir. 2007)..... 8

*T-Rex Property AB v. Adaptive Micro Systems, LLC*,  
Case No. 1:16-cv-05667 (N.D. Ill. May 27, 2016) ..... 3

*Winfield v. City of N.Y.*,  
15-cv-5236-LTS-DCF, 2016 WL 6208564 (S.D.N.Y. Oct. 24, 2016) ..... 5

**Statutes**

Uniform Commercial Code §2-312(3)..... 11

**Other Authorities**

Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (b)(1)..... 1, 5

Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a) ..... 12

Plaintiff BroadSign International, LLC (“BroadSign” or “Plaintiff”) submits this memorandum of law in opposition to the motion by Defendant T-Rex Property AB (“T-Rex” or “Defendant”) to dismiss the Amended Complaint pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (b)(1) (D.I. 15, D. I. 16). A declaration of BroadSign's outside patent consultant, Sandra Beauchesne (“Beauchesne Decl.”), accompanies this memorandum.

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

This is an action for a declaratory judgment of non-infringement and intervening rights directed to three patents owned and/or controlled by T-Rex. T-Rex is a prolific non-practicing entity that has the rights to a portfolio of patents in the field of digital signage. Since 2012, T-Rex has filed at least 59 patent infringement cases against more than 80 companies, in 17 judicial districts throughout the United States. All of these cases allege infringement of one or more of the following patents: U.S. Patent No. RE39, 470 (“the ’470 patent”); U.S. Patent No. 7,382,334 (“the ’334 patent”); and U.S. Patent No. 6,430,603 (“the ’603 patent”) (collectively, the “patents-in-suit”). BroadSign initiated this declaratory judgment action because T-Rex has sued several of BroadSign's customers accusing the products BroadSign sold to them of infringing the patents-in-suit and because direct communications between BroadSign and T-Rex made it apparent that T-Rex is adverse to BroadSign. T-Rex has demonstrated its intention to continue to accuse BroadSign's products of infringement, has refused to provide BroadSign with a covenant not to sue and has demanded that BroadSign take a license to protect itself and its customers from further suits. In response, BroadSign brought this action so that its business can move forward without the imminent and ever-present threat of litigation. It is difficult to imagine a case where a supplier of accused products and a potential target of a non-practicing entity has a clearer right to seek declaratory relief than BroadSign does here.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.