Case 1:14-cv-02758-PAC Document 128 Filed 01/13/17 Page 1 of 35

H155kowC UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 1 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK 2 3 KOWA COMPANY, LTD., et al., Plaintiffs, 4 New York, N.Y. 5 14 Civ. 2758 (PAC) 14 Civ. 2759 (PAC) V. 6 14 Civ. 2760 (PAC) AMNEAL PHARMACEUTICALS, LLC. 14 Civ. 5575 (PAC) 7 14 Civ. 7934 (PAC) et al., 15 Civ. 3935 (PAC) 8 Defendants. 9 10 January 5, 2017 2:30 p.m. 11 Before: 12 HON. PAUL A. CROTTY, 13 District Judge 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25



H155kowC

| 1 | APPEARANCES |
|-----|---|
| 2 | MINTZ, LEVIN, COHN, FERRIS, GLOVSKY & POPEO, P.C. |
| 3 | Attorneys for Plaintiffs BY: JENNIFER L. DEREKA |
| 4 | DAVID G. CONLIN KATHLEEN B. CARR |
| 5 | ADAM PHILLIP SAMANSKY |
| 6 | MADDOX EDWARDS, PLLC Attorneys for Defendants Amneal and Apotex |
| 7 | BY: STEVEN A. MADDOX |
| 8 | ALSTON & BIRD, LLP Attorneys for Defendant Orient |
| 9 | BY: NATALIE C. CLAYTON FRANK G. SMITH |
| 10 | YI WEN WU SHRI M. ABHYANKAR |
| 11 | WHITERS BERGMAN, LLP |
| 12 | Attorneys for Defendants Zydus and Cadila BY: STEVEN J. MOORE |
| | JAMES E. NEALON |
| 13 | SUGHRUE MION, PLLC |
| 14 | Attorneys for Defendant Sawai BY: AZY S. KOKABI |
| 15 | CHIDAMBARAM S. IYER -AND- |
| 16 | FLEMMING, ZULACK, WILLIAMSON, ZAUDERER, LLP BY: CRAIG S. KESCH |
| 17 | KELLEY DRYE & WARREN, LLP |
| 18 | Attorneys for Defendant Lupin BY: BETH D. JACOB |
| 19 | DOUGLASS C. HOCHSTETLER MALAVIKA A. RAO |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | |
| 24 | |
| 2.5 | |



1 (Case called) 2 THE DEPUTY CLERK: Counsel for plaintiffs, please 3 state your appearances. 4 MS. DEREKA: Good afternoon, your Honor. Jennifer 5 Dereka from Mintz Levin, here on behalf of plaintiffs Kowa 6 Company Ltd, et al. Here with me today to my immediate right, 7 Kathleen Carr. 8 THE COURT: Ms. Carr. 9 MS. CARR: Good afternoon, your Honor. 10 MS. DEREKA: David Conlin. 11 THE COURT: Mr. Conlin. MR. CONLIN: Your Honor. 12 13 MS. DEREKA: And Adam Samansky. 14 MR. SAMANSKY: Good afternoon. 15 THE COURT: Mr. Samansky. THE DEPUTY CLERK: For defendants, beginning with 16 17 Amneal Pharmaceuticals. 18 MR. MADDOX: Good afternoon, your Honor. Steven Maddox from Maddox Edwards for defendant Amneal Pharmaceutical 19 20 Company and also for Apotex. 21 THE COURT: You are substituted in today? 22 MR. MADDOX: Yes. 23 THE COURT: Thank you, Mr. Maddox.



24

25

THE DEPUTY CLERK: For Orient Pharmaceuticals.

MS. CLAYTON: Good afternoon, your Honor. Natalie

Clayton with Alston & Bird for Orient. With me today is my 1 2 partner Frank Smith from the Atlanta office. 3 Hello, Mr. Smith. Nice to see you again. THE COURT: 4 MR. SMITH: Nice to see you, your Honor. 5 MS. CLAYTON: Shri Abhyankar and Wen Wu. 6 THE COURT: Thank you. 7 THE DEPUTY CLERK: For Zydus? MR. MOORE: Steven Moore for Zydus Pharmaceuticals, 8 9 USA, Cadila Healthcare, and with my colleague James Nealon. 10 THE DEPUTY CLERK: For Sawai? 11 MS. KOKABI: Good afternoon. My name is Azy Kokabi 12 for Sawai Pharmaceuticals of Sughrue Mion, and with me today is my partner Chid Iyer, and also Craig Kesch from the law firm of 13 14 Flemming Zulack. 15 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Kokabi. 16 THE DEPUTY CLERK: And for Lupin? 17 MS. JACOB: Your Honor, Beth Jacob of Kelley, Drye & 18 Warren, and with me is Douglass Hochstetler, Constantine Koutsoubas and Malavika Rao. 19 20 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Jacob. 21

The first thing I would like to take up is the motions in limine. I have read all the papers and I am prepared to rule. Does anybody want to argue?

MS. CLAYTON: We have prepared short argument on the MILs that the defendants have filed, if the Court wishes to



22

23

24

25

hear them. 1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE COURT: I have read all the papers. Unless you are going to add something new rather than emphasizing points that you have already made.

MS. CLAYTON: For Orient, your Honor, we can rest on the papers. Some of the other defendants had some other issues that they raised. I would just make sure that they don't have anything to add.

MR. MADDOX: Nothing for Amneal or Apotex.

MR. MOORE: For Zydus Pharmaceuticals, we wanted to add in a copy of the Phillips v. AWH Corporation case which I think answers the entire question and fact that the federal circuit actually defines the ordinary and clear meaning of a term as being deemed to have the expert having read the specification and that's what this whole argument was about. If I can hand that up to the Court?

THE COURT: Yes.

Mr. Samansky?

MR. SAMANSKY: Your Honor, with respect to that same motion, I think it is fair to say we disagree with counsel's characterization of the Phillips case. We also noticed there was one page missing from the reply declaration. We can hand a copy of that missing page up if the Court would desire, or take care of that after the hearing.

THE COURT: I didn't notice the one page that was



DOCKET

Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

