

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

Kowa Company, Ltd.,
Kowa Pharmaceuticals America, Inc., and
Nissan Chemical Industries, Ltd.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Amneal Pharmaceuticals, LLC,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 14-CV-2758 (PAC)

Kowa Company, Ltd.,
Kowa Pharmaceuticals America, Inc., and
Nissan Chemical Industries, Ltd.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Zydus Pharmaceuticals (USA) Inc., and Cadila
Healthcare Ltd. (dba Zydus Cadila),

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 14-CV-2760 (PAC)

Kowa Company, Ltd.,
Kowa Pharmaceuticals America, Inc., and
Nissan Chemical Industries, Ltd.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Orient Pharma Co., Ltd.,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 14-CV-2759 (PAC)

Kowa Company, Ltd.,
Kowa Pharmaceuticals America, Inc., and
Nissan Chemical Industries, Ltd.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Sawai USA, Inc., and
Sawai Pharmaceutical Co., Ltd.,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 14-CV-5575 (PAC)

Kowa Company, Ltd.,
Kowa Pharmaceuticals America, Inc., and
Nissan Chemical Industries, Ltd.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Apotex, Inc. and Apotex Corp.,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 14-CV-7934 (PAC)

Kowa Company, Ltd.,
Kowa Pharmaceuticals America, Inc., and
Nissan Chemical Industries, Ltd.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Lupin Ltd. and Lupin Pharmaceuticals, Inc.,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 15-CV-3935 (PAC)

DEFENDANTS PROPOSED FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW RE:

**INVALIDITY OF THE '336 PATENT IN LIGHT OF
THE DOCTRINE OF OBVIOUSNESS-TYPE DOUBLE PATENTING**

PRESENTED ON BEHALF OF AMNEAL, ORIENT, SAWAI AND ZYDUS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT REGARDING THE INVALIDITY OF THE '336 PATENT UNDER THE DOCTRINE OF OBVIOUSNESS-TYPE DOUBLE PATENTING	1
A.	Technical Background	1
1.	Stereochemistry of a molecule – generally.....	1
2.	Statins.....	2
3.	Salts.....	3
B.	The '336 Patent.....	5
1.	Background.....	5
2.	The Definition of a Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art	7
C.	The Obviousness-Type Double Patenting References.....	8
1.	Patent No. 5,872,130.....	8
2.	Patent No. 5,284,953 (“the '953 Patent”).....	10
II.	PROPOSED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW REGARDING THE INVALIDITY OF CLAIMS 1 AND 2 OF THE '336 PATENT UNDER THE DOCTRINE OF OBVIOUSNESS-TYPE DOUBLE PATENTING OBVIOUSNESS	15
A.	Obviousness-Type Double Patenting-Legal Standard.....	16
B.	Claims 1 and 2 of the '336 Patent Are Invalid for Obviousness Type Double-Patenting In View of Claims 1 and 5 of the '130 Patent	18
1.	The '130 Patent and the '336 Patent Have the Same Assignee and Inventors	18
2.	Plaintiffs Have not Rebutted that Claims 1 and 2 of the '336 Patent is Patentably Indistinct from Claims 1 and 5 of the '130 Patent	18
3.	The '130 Patent Is Available as an Obviousness-Type Double Patenting Reference	21
a)	The Safe Harbour Provision of 35 U.S.C. §121 is Inapplicable...	21
4.	The '130 Patent Is Available as an Obviousness Type Double Patenting Reference	22

C.	Claims 1 and 2 of the '336 Patent Are Invalid for Obviousness Type Double Patenting In View of Claim 1 of the '953 Patent.....	23
1.	The '336 Patent and the '953 Patent Have the Same Assignee	23
2.	The One-Way Test Applies	23
3.	The '336 Patent Is Patentably Indistinct from the '953 Patent Under the One-Way Test	25
4.	Claims 1 and 2 of the '336 Patent Is Patentably Indistinct from the Claim 1 of the '953 Patent Under the Two-Way Test	29
a)	It Would Have Been Obvious to Isolate the Single Stereoisomer from the Mixture of Stereoisomers.....	30
b)	It Would Have Been Obvious to Go from the Calcium Salt to the Phenethylamine Salt.....	34

..

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.