

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

PHILIPS NORTH AMERICA LLC,

Plaintiff,

v.

FITBIT, INC.,

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 1:19-cv-11586-FDS

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION
TO STRIKE FITBIT'S INEQUITABLE CONDUCT DEFENSE**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. BACKGROUND 1

II. LEGAL STANDARDS 4

III. ARGUMENT..... 7

 A. Fitbit’s Delay and Untimeliness of Inequitable Conduct Defense..... 8

 B. Fitbit’s Inequitable Conduct “Facts” Are Demonstrably False 9

 C. Fitbit’s Pleading of Materiality Fails as a Matter of Law 12

 D. Fitbit Fails to Plausibly Plead Any Cognizable form of Intent..... 15

IV. CONCLUSION 21

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Aevoe Corp. v. Ae Tech. Co.</i> , No. 2:12-cv-00053-GMN-NJK, 2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 31647 (D. Nev. Mar. 7, 2013).....	17
<i>Alps S., LLC v. Ohio Willow Wood Co.</i> , No. 8:09-cv-00386-EAK-MAP, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 11330 (M.D. Fla. Jan. 31, 2012)....	17
<i>Aquestive Therapeutics, Inc. v. Biodelivery Scis. Int’l, Inc.</i> , No. 5:19-CV-505-D, 2021 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 49667 (E.D.N.C. Mar. 16, 2021).....	12, 13
<i>Boehringer Ingelheim Int’l GmbH v. Barr Labs., Inc.</i> , 592 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2010).....	14
<i>In re BP Lubricants USA Inc.</i> , 637 F.3d 1307 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....	7, 20
<i>Burns v. Hale & Dorr LLP</i> , 242 F.R.D. 170 (D. Mass. 2007).....	4
<i>Charest v. Fannie Mae</i> , 9 F. Supp. 3d 114 (D. Mass. 2014)	11
<i>Clorox Co. v. Proctor & Gamble Commercial Co.</i> , 228 F.3d 24 (1st Cir. 2000).....	11
<i>Delano Farms Co. v. Cal. Table Grape Comm’n</i> , 655 F.3d 1337 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....	6
<i>Eisai Co., Ltd. v. Dr. Reddy’s Laboratories, Ltd.</i> , No. 03 Civ. 9053(GEL), 2007 WL 1437834 (S.D.N.Y. May 14, 2007)	5, 14, 15, 18
<i>Eli Lilly & Co. v. Teva Parenteral Meds., Inc.</i> , 845 F.3d 1357 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....	14
<i>ESCO Corp. v. Cashman Equip. Co.</i> , 158 F. Supp. 3d 1051 (D. Nev. 2016).....	16, 20
<i>Exergen Corp. v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.</i> , 575 F.3d 1312 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....	5, 9, 12, 16
<i>Federico v. Town of Rowley</i> , Civil Action No. 15-12360-FDS, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 169228 (D. Mass. Dec. 7, 2016)	4

<i>Glob. Tech LED, Ltd. Liab. Co. v. HiLumz Int'l Corp.</i> , No. 2:15-cv-553-FtM-29CM, 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 20512 (M.D. Fla. Feb. 14, 2017).....	19
<i>Helget v. Fitbit, Inc.</i> , Case No. 21-mc-91150-FDS, Dkt. 2 (D. Mass. Feb. 19, 2021).....	2
<i>Helget v. Fitbit, Inc.</i> , Case No. 21-mc-91150-FDS, Dkt. 3-1 (D. Mass. Feb. 19, 2021)	2, 8
<i>Helget v. Fitbit, Inc.</i> , Case No. 21-mc-91150-FDS, Dkt. 3-2 (D. Mass. Feb. 19, 2021)	8
<i>Helget v. Fitbit, Inc.</i> , Case No. 21-mc-91150-FDS, Dkt. 20 (D. Mass. Mar. 1, 2021).....	3
<i>Helget v. Fitbit, Inc.</i> , Case No. 21-mc-91150-FDS, Dkt. 21-2 (D. Mass. Mar. 1, 2021)	9
<i>Helget v. Fitbit, Inc.</i> , Case No. 21-mc-91150-FDS, Dkt. 25 (D. Mass. Mar. 5, 2021)	2, 3, 8, 9
<i>Helget v. Fitbit, Inc.</i> , Case No. 21-mc-91150-FDS, Dkt. 48 (D. Mass. May 3, 2021)	3, 9
<i>IBM v. Priceline Grp., Inc.</i> , Civil Action No. 15-137-LPS-CJB, 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 54285 (D. Del. Apr. 10, 2017) .	13
<i>Lifeguard Licensing Corp. v. Kozak</i> , No. 15 Civ. 8459 (LGS)(JCF), 2016 WL 3144049 (S.D.N.Y. May 23, 2016)	8
<i>Mycone Dental Supply Co. v. Creative Nail Design, Inc.</i> , Civil Action No. 11-4380, 2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 88652 (D.N.J. June 24, 2013).....	7, 20
<i>O'Connell v. Hyatt Hotels</i> , 357 F.3d 152 (1st Cir. 2004).....	4
<i>PetEdge, Inc. v. Fortress Secure Solutions, LLC</i> , Civil Action No. 15-11988-FDS, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 12201 (D. Mass. Feb. 2, 2016)....	5, 6
<i>Pfizer, Inc. v. Teva Pharm. USA, Inc.</i> , 803 F. Supp. 2d 409 (E.D. Va. 2011)	6
<i>SAP Am., Inc. v. Purple Leaf, Inc.</i> , No. C 11-4601 PJH, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 83531 (N.D. Cal. June 15, 2012).....	13
<i>Scripps Clinic v. Genentech</i> , 927 F.2d 1565 (Fed. Cir. 1991).....	5

Therasense, Inc. v. Becton, Dickinson and Co.,
649 F.3d 1276 (Fed. Cir. 2011)..... *passim*

UFCW v. Novartis Pharm. Corp.,
C.A. No. 15-cv-12732, 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 102389 (D. Mass. June 30, 2017)10

Vaughan Co. v. Glob. Bio-Fuels Tech., LLC,
No. 1:12-CV-1292, 2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 152068 (N.D.N.Y. Oct. 23, 2013)16

XpertUniverse, Inc. v. Cisco Sys., Inc.,
868 F. Supp. 2d 376 (D. Del. 2012).....13

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 101.....13

Other Authorities

Fed. R. Civ. P. 9..... *passim*

Fed. R. Civ. P. 12.....4, 8, 9

Fed. R. Civ. P. 16.....4

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.