

# EXHIBIT 4

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

RAO TATA-VENKATA  
IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS  
EASTERN DIVISION

HOSPIRA, INC., )  
)  
Plaintiff, )C.A. No.  
)1:16-cv-00651  
vs. )  
)  
FRESENIUS KABI USA, LLC., )  
)  
)  
Defendant. )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

HOSPIRA, INC., )  
)  
Plaintiff/Counterclaim )C.A. No.  
Defendant. )15-cv-697-RGA  
vs. )  
)  
AMNEAL PHARMACEUTICALS, LLC )  
)  
Defendant/Counterclaim )  
Plaintiff. )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF RAO TATA-VENKATA  
Wednesday, November 9, 2016  
Chicago, Illinois

Reported By:  
TRICIA J. FLASKA, CSR, RPR  
JOB NO. 115353

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
 2 48 hours, correct?  
 3 A Yes.  
 4 Q Okay. So it's not 24 hours?  
 5 A Yes.  
 6 Q Okay. And there's -- and it refers to data  
 7 on file.  
 8 Do you see that?  
 9 A Yes.  
 10 Q And so that's referring to an internal  
 11 Hospira study?  
 12 A Yes.  
 13 Q Okay. And that's a study that would have  
 14 been performed within the R&D group?  
 15 A Yes.  
 16 Q Okay. And so it's actually 48 hours that  
 17 this is available -- that this is stable, correct?  
 18 A That is correct.  
 19 Q Okay. Now, you also said that it would --  
 20 would have been unexpected for a formulation of  
 21 dexmedetomidine to be stable in a glass container at  
 22 a -- what you called a low concentration, correct?  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q Okay. Now, the range in the Wu Declaration  
 25 and in the patent we saw was up to 50 micrograms per

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
 2 milliliter.  
 3 Do you remember that?  
 4 A Yes. Yes.  
 5 Q Okay. So would you consider anything less  
 6 than 50 micrograms per milliliter a low  
 7 concentration?  
 8 A The term "low concentration" is very broad  
 9 unless it's actually defined. What do you mean by  
 10 that? Tell me.  
 11 Q Well, you said there was an expectation of  
 12 -- of -- that it wouldn't be stable in a glass  
 13 container at a low concentration.  
 14 A Right.  
 15 Q And the claims of the patent go up to 50  
 16 micrograms per milliliter.  
 17 So my question is: Is that 50 micrograms  
 18 per milliliter included in your expectation for a  
 19 lack of stability?  
 20 A The data was generated across a range from  
 21 one microgram per mil to 50 microgram per mil.  
 22 So --  
 23 Q Right.  
 24 A -- if -- if your question is what  
 25 expectations did we have -- did we have about the

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
 2 outcome?  
 3 Q Yeah.  
 4 A That was the purpose of the experiment.  
 5 Q You didn't have an expectation --  
 6 A Yes.  
 7 Q -- ahead of time?  
 8 A Yes.  
 9 Q Okay. But you previously said that you  
 10 would have expected that, for a low concentration  
 11 product in a glass vial, it would not show stability  
 12 because of the low concentration, correct?  
 13 MR. RAY: Objection. Mischaracterizes  
 14 testimony.  
 15 BY MR. WALLACE:  
 16 Q Is that not your testimony?  
 17 A No.  
 18 Q Maybe I got it wrong.  
 19 A No, the 100 microgram per mil is a  
 20 concentration that we -- we had whatever data we had  
 21 as far as stability is concerned.  
 22 Q Okay.  
 23 A When we go to low concentrations, things --  
 24 phenomena can occur at low concentrations that will  
 25 not -- can occur at low concentrations that do not

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
 2 occur at high concentrations.  
 3 Q Okay.  
 4 A And that would have to be only determined  
 5 and confirmed with studies.  
 6 Q Okay. And were you aware of any studies  
 7 involving concentrations of dexmedetomidine at a  
 8 concentration of less than 100 micrograms per  
 9 milliliter in a glass container before you began  
 10 your work -- or before Hospira began its work --  
 11 A No.  
 12 Q -- on dexmedetomidine?  
 13 A No.  
 14 Q Okay. Okay. I'll give you the next  
 15 document.  
 16 (Exhibit 17 marked for identification.)  
 17 BY MR. WALLACE:  
 18 Q I'm giving you what's been marked as  
 19 Defendant's Exhibit -- or Exhibit 17 --  
 20 A Okay.  
 21 Q -- documents bearing the Bates number  
 22 Hospira00308480 through 308778.  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q And I can tell you this is only the first  
 25 300 pages of this document because it actually is a

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
 2 2,000-page document, but I --  
 3 A Okay.  
 4 Q -- we chopped it down for -- for ease of  
 5 carrying it around.  
 6 Have you ever seen this document before?  
 7 A Yes. I -- as you said, it's a very large  
 8 document. I scrolled through it very quickly.  
 9 Q Okay. And this is the Investigational New  
 10 Drug Application for Dexmedetomidine, correct?  
 11 A Yes.  
 12 Q And the name of the drug is identified in  
 13 box 5 on the front page, correct?  
 14 A Yes.  
 15 Q Okay. And so an investigational new drug  
 16 application is the application even before any  
 17 clinical studies can be run, correct?  
 18 A Yes. Yes.  
 19 Q Okay. And this is -- this was data that  
 20 was available to -- to -- that was used by Abbott in  
 21 order -- in order to develop its clinical program,  
 22 correct?  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q Okay. And this is data that would have --  
 25 that was in -- that was available to Hospira's

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
 2 regulatory group in order to maintain the new drug  
 3 application and the regulatory file for  
 4 dexmedetomidine, correct?  
 5 A That would be available with the Regulatory  
 6 Affairs, yes.  
 7 Q Okay. Available with the Regulatory  
 8 Affairs within Hospira, correct?  
 9 A Right.  
 10 Q Okay. I want to jump ahead -- I'm sorry --  
 11 first we'll look at the Table of Contents, and you  
 12 can see the Table Of Contents extends on for several  
 13 pages and describes both -- well, protocols,  
 14 chemistry, manufacturing, pharmacology, toxicology  
 15 and many other studies.  
 16 Do you see that?  
 17 A Yes.  
 18 Q Okay. And included with -- within those,  
 19 if you look on page 2 of the Table of Contents,  
 20 which is -- ends in Bates number 8483 under section  
 21 7, you see chemistry, manufacturing and control  
 22 data?  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q Okay. And you see that the second to last  
 25 entry here is stability?

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
 2 A Yes.  
 3 Q Okay. So this is stability data that was  
 4 generated on these products --  
 5 A Yes.  
 6 Q -- correct? Okay.  
 7 So let's turn to that stability data. It's  
 8 internal page three hundred and about -- well, it's  
 9 about 278, but I'll tell you the Bates number at the  
 10 bottom ends in 8761. It's most of the way to the  
 11 back.  
 12 A Yes.  
 13 Q You see there's a cover sheet, "Stability  
 14 data" -- you know what, I'm sorry. I jumped too far  
 15 ahead.  
 16 It's actually, we're going to start on page  
 17 -- the number ends in 751. And it says, "Stability  
 18 data from batch NI027L1 is enclosed."  
 19 Do you see that?  
 20 A Yes.  
 21 Q Okay. And so we turn to the next page,  
 22 page Bates number 8752 of Exhibit 17 --  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q -- and we see an identification of the same  
 25 batch number, NI027L1.

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
 2 Do you see that?  
 3 A Yes.  
 4 Q And the strength is 20 micrograms per  
 5 milliliter.  
 6 Do you see that?  
 7 A Yes.  
 8 Q This is a product manufactured in September  
 9 of 1987?  
 10 A Yes.  
 11 Q Okay. And I want you to look down at the  
 12 entry three package. It's packaged in a clear,  
 13 colorless, glass ampoule.  
 14 Do you see that?  
 15 A Yes.  
 16 Q And as you described earlier, an ampoule is  
 17 a glass container that's sealed on itself, correct?  
 18 A Yes.  
 19 Q So it's a completely sealed glass  
 20 container, right?  
 21 A Yes.  
 22 Q Okay. And we see, in part 2 here, the  
 23 conditions of storage.  
 24 Do you see that?  
 25 A Yes.

Page 278

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
2 Q And it was stored for up to 12 months at  
3 25C?  
4 A Yes.  
5 Q And that's considered a room temperature  
6 storage condition?  
7 A Yes.  
8 Q And that's the same type of storage  
9 conditions that were used in the -- the Wu  
10 Declaration, correct?  
11 A Yes.  
12 Q And it's the same storage conditions that  
13 were used for the submission of the Precedex premix  
14 to the FDA?  
15 A Along with other conditions, but this is  
16 one of the conditions.  
17 Q Yes. Okay. And it says, "The results are  
18 presented in table 1."  
19 Do you see that?  
20 A Uh-huh.  
21 Q And so if we turn to Bates number 8756, we  
22 find table 1.  
23 You see that, Doctor?  
24 A Yes.  
25 Q Okay. And we see that at the initial time

Page 280

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
2 Do you see that?  
3 A Yes.  
4 Q Stored at 25C?  
5 A Yes.  
6 Q And here the assay is 98 percent again,  
7 correct?  
8 A Uh-huh.  
9 Q So it's identical to the initial assay of  
10 -- for this sample, correct?  
11 A Yes.  
12 Q Okay. And then if we turn -- if we go to  
13 the next line, we have nine month data for the same  
14 sample, correct?  
15 A Yes.  
16 Q And we see the assay is a hundred percent?  
17 A Yes.  
18 Q So it's still -- it has not lost potency at  
19 this point, correct?  
20 A Yes.  
21 Q And then we see 12 month data here.  
22 Do you see that, the line for 12 months?  
23 A Yes.  
24 Q And we're back, again, at 97 percent assay.  
25 You see that?

Page 279

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
2 point, the assay here is 98 percent.  
3 Do you see that?  
4 A Yes.  
5 Q And do you understand that the assay refers  
6 to the amount of dexmedetomidine as compared to the  
7 claimed concentration of 20 micrograms per  
8 milliliter?  
9 A Yes.  
10 Q Okay. And then we see that, after two  
11 months of being stored at 25C, the result is 97  
12 percent of assay, correct?  
13 A Yes.  
14 Q So it has lost no more than one percent of  
15 concentration, correct?  
16 A Yes.  
17 Q Okay. And then the next entry is three  
18 months of 25C and the assay is, again, 97 percent,  
19 correct?  
20 A Yes.  
21 Q So, again, it has lost no more than one  
22 percent from the initial assay, correct?  
23 A Yes.  
24 Q Okay. If we turn to the third entry, we  
25 have six months data.

Page 281

1 RAO TATA-VENKATA  
2 A Yes.  
3 Q So it has lost no more than one percent  
4 from the -- from when it was initially placed on  
5 stability, correct?  
6 A Yes.  
7 Q Now, to be clear, a 20 microgram per  
8 milliliter concentration of dexmedetomidine falls  
9 within the range that is claimed in the patents that  
10 we looked at before, correct?  
11 A Yes.  
12 Q So there was data that would provide an  
13 expectation for stability of dexmedetomidine in a  
14 sealed glass container at a concentration of less  
15 than 100 micrograms per milliliter, correct?  
16 A According to this data that's here, yes.  
17 Q Okay. And this is an IND, correct?  
18 A Yes.  
19 Q So an IND is data that is provided to the  
20 FDA?  
21 A Yes.  
22 Q So it is accurate data, presumption is that  
23 it's accurate data?  
24 A The date is accurate.  
25 Q Okay. If we turn, now, to the page ending

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.