

# EXHIBIT B

## Ashraf, Amina

---

**From:** Justin A. Nelson <jnelson@SusmanGodfrey.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, July 10, 2017 5:25 PM  
**To:** Ashraf, Amina; mlowrie@foley.com; Modi, Naveen  
**Cc:** bfarnan@farnanlaw.com; mfarnan@farnanlaw.com; Bill Carmody; Tamar Lusztig; mambros@foley.com  
**Subject:** RE: Univ. of Mass. Med. School and Carmel Labs., LLC v. L'Oréal S.A. and L'Oréal USA, Inc.

Dear Naveen:

Thank you for your letter of July 7, 2017. It is an inauspicious way to start a dialogue with opposing counsel by insinuating a Rule 11 violation. Rest assured, our firms have conducted a good faith investigation that more than satisfies Rule 11. Our experience is that further letter-writing campaigns on this point make little sense. We strongly disagree that we have somehow failed to adequately plead infringement. If, however, you believe in good faith that we have not adequately pleaded something, then make your motion. We look forward to interacting with you in a cooperative and friendly manner.

On a separate note, can you please let us know whether you will accept service on behalf of L'Oreal S.A.? Should you accept, we will of course be amenable to a reasonable extension for you to file your responsive pleading on behalf of both defendants. I have included only you and Amina Ashraf on this email but please let us know whether we should include others from your firm or prior settlement counsel.

Regards,

Justin

---

**From:** Ashraf, Amina [<mailto:aminaashraf@paulhastings.com>]  
**Sent:** Friday, July 07, 2017 2:25 PM  
**To:** [mlowrie@foley.com](mailto:mlowrie@foley.com)  
**Cc:** [bfarnan@farnanlaw.com](mailto:bfarnan@farnanlaw.com); [mfarnan@farnanlaw.com](mailto:mfarnan@farnanlaw.com); Bill Carmody; Tamar Lusztig; Justin A. Nelson; [mambros@foley.com](mailto:mambros@foley.com)  
**Subject:** Univ. of Mass. Med. School and Carmel Labs., LLC v. L'Oréal S.A. and L'Oréal USA, Inc.

Counsel,

Please see the attached.

Regards,  
Amina Ashraf



**Amina Ashraf | Client Service Specialist**

Paul Hastings LLP | 875 15th Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20005 | Direct:  
+1.202.551.1230 | Main: +1.202.551.1700 | Fax: +1.202.551.0130 |  
[AminaAshraf@PaulHastings.com](mailto:AminaAshraf@PaulHastings.com) | [www.paulhastings.com](http://www.paulhastings.com)

\*\*\*\*\*

This message is sent by a law firm and may contain information that is privileged or confidential. If you received this transmission in error, please notify the sender by reply e-mail and delete the message and any attachments.

For additional information, please visit our website at