

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE**

UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS
MEDICAL SCHOOL and CARMEL
LABORATORIES, LLC,

Plaintiffs,

v.

L'ORÉAL S.A. and L'ORÉAL USA, INC.,

Defendants.

Case No. 17-cv-868-JFB-SRF

**PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT L'ORÉAL USA, INC.'S
OPENING BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF L'ORÉAL USA, INC.'S MOTION TO
DISMISS PLAINTIFFS' FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT**

Dated: September 5, 2017

Of Counsel:

William Christopher Carmody
Tamar E. Lusztig
Susman Godfrey L.L.P.
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Floor
New York, NY 10019

Justin A. Nelson
Susman Godfrey L.L.P.
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 5100
Houston, Texas 77002

Matthew B. Lowrie
Matthew A. Ambros
Foley & Lardner
111 Huntington Avenue, Suite 2600
Boston, MA 02199

Brian E. Farnan (Bar No. 4089)
Michael J. Farnan (Bar No. 5165)
Farnan LLP
919 North Market Street, 12th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801
(302) 777-0300
bfarnan@farnanlaw.com
mfarnan@farnanlaw.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	i
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. LEGAL STANDARD.....	2
III. ARGUMENT	2
a. The First Amended Complaint Contains Sufficiently Detailed Allegations to Support a Claim for Direct Infringement	2
b. The First Amended Complaint Meets the Requirements for Induced Infringement.....	8
c. The First Amended Complaint Adequately Pleads Contributory Infringement.....	11
d. The First Amended Complaint’s Claim for Willful Infringement is Plausible.....	13
e. Plaintiffs Should be Permitted to Replead Their Allegations if Necessary	15
IV. CONCLUSION.....	16

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

Bayer AG v. Elan Pharm. Research Corp.,
212 F.3d 1241 (Fed. Cir. 2000)..... 7

Bell Atl. Corp. v. Twombly,
550 U.S. 544 (2007)..... 2

Cipla Ltd. v. Sunovion Pharm. Inc.,
174 F. Supp. 3d 869 (D. Del. 2016)..... 9, 12

Collabo Innovations, Inc. v. Omnivision Technologies, Inc.,
C.A. No. 16-197-SLR-SRF, 2017 WL 374484 (D. Del. Jan. 25, 2017)..... 10

Commonwealth Research Grp. LLC v. Lattice Semiconductor Corp.,
C.A. No. 11-655-RGA, 2012 WL 2501107 (D. Del. June 28, 2012)..... 6

Conair Corp. v. Jarden Corp.,
2014 WL 3955172 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 12, 2014)..... 12

Courtesy Prod., L.L.C. v. Hamilton Beach Brands, Inc.,
73 F. Supp. 3d 435 (D. Del. 2014)..... 13

DermaFocus LLC v. Ulthera, Inc.,
201 F.Supp.3d 465 (D. Del. 2016)..... 4

Driessen v. Sony Music Entm't,
2013 WL 4501063 (D. Utah Aug. 22, 2013)..... 12

DSU Med. Corp. v. JMS Co.,
471 F.3d 1293 (Fed. Cir. 2006)..... 9

Golden Blount, Inc. v. Robert H. Peterson Co.,
365 F.3d 1054 (Fed. Cir. 2004)..... 12

i4i Ltd. P'ship v. Microsoft Corp.,
598 F.3d 831 (Fed. Cir. 2010)..... 11

In re Bill of Lading,
681 F.3d 1323 (Fed. Cir. 2012)..... 11

Intamin Ltd. v. Magnetar Techs., Corp.,
483 F.3d 1328 (Fed. Cir. 2007)..... 6

Intellectual Ventures I LLC v. AT&T Mobility LLC,
2017 WL 658469 (D. Del. Feb. 14, 2017)..... 3

..

Iron Gate Security, Inc. v. Lowe’s Companies, Inc.,
2016 WL 1070853 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 16, 2016) 11

Krantz v. Prudential Investments Fund Mgmt. LLC,
305 F.3d 140 (3d Cir. 2002)..... 15

Krantz v. Prudential Investments Fund Mgmt. LLC,
77 F. Supp. 2d 559 (D.N.J. 1999) 15

Lucent Techs., Inc. v. Gateway, Inc.,
580 F.3d 1301 (Fed. Cir. 2009)..... 10

Macronix Int’l Co., Ltd. v. Spansion Inc.,
4 F. Supp. 3d 797 (E.D. Va. 2014) 7, 15

Mayne Pharma Int’l PTY Ltd. v. Merck & Co.,
C.A. No. 15-438-LPS-CJB, 2015 WL 7833206 (D. Del. Dec. 3, 2015) 14

McZeal v. Spring Nextel Corp.,
501 F.3d 1354 (Fed. Cir. 2007)..... 2, 3

Merck Sharp & Dohme Corp. v. Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.,
2015 WL 4036951 (D. Del. July 1, 2015) 11

Nespresso USA, Inc. v. Ethical Coffee Co. SA,
C.A. No. 16-194-GMS, 2017 WL 3021066 (D. Del. July 14, 2017)..... 15

Nexxon Ltd. v. Eaglepicher Techs., LLC,
C.A. No. 15-955-RGA-MPT, 2016 WL 4045474 (D. Del. July 26, 2016) 9

Raindance Techs., Inc. v. 10x Genomics, Inc.,
C.A. No. 15-152-RGA, 2016 WL 927143 (D. Del. Mar. 4, 2016)..... 6

ReefEdge Networks, LLC v. Juniper Networks, Inc.,
29 F. Supp. 3d 455 (D. Del. 2014)..... 10

SIPCO, LLC v. Streetline, Inc.,
230 F. Supp. 3d 351 (D. Del. 2017)..... 7, 15

Skinner v. Switzer,
131 S.Ct. 1289 (2011)..... 2

St. Clair Intellectual Prop. Consultants, Inc. v. Hewlett-Packard Co.,
C.A. No. 10-425-LPS, 2012 WL 1134318 (D. Del. Mar. 28, 2012) 14, 15

Swierkiewicz v. Sorema N.A.,
534 U.S. 506 (2002)..... 2

...

Telecomm Innovations, LLC v. Ricoh Co., Ltd.,
966 F. Supp. 2d 390 (D. Del. 2013)..... 9

Uniloc USA, Inc. v. Avaya Inc.,
C.A. No. 6:15-CV-1168-JRG, 2016 WL 7042236 (E.D. Tex. May 13, 2016)..... 10

United States Gypsum Company v. New NGC, Inc.,
2017 WL 2538569 (D. Del. June 12, 2017)..... 3

Walker Digital, LLC v. Facebook, Inc.,
852 F. Supp. 2d 559 (D. Del. 2012)..... 13, 14

Zimmer Surgical, Inc. v. Stryker Corp.,
C.A. No. 16-679-RGA-MPT, 2017 WL 1296026 (D. Del. Apr. 6, 2017)..... 10

Rules

Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a)(2)..... 15

Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(a)(2)..... 3

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.