1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE
ACCELERATION BAY, LLC :
: Plaintiff, : No. 16-453-RGA
v. :
: ACTIVISION BLIZZARD, INC. :
: Defendant.
ACCELERATION BAY, LLC : : No. 16-454-RGA
Plaintiff, : v.
ELECTRONIC ARTS, INC.,
:
<u>Defendant.</u> ACCELERATION BAY, LLC :
: No. 16-455-RGA
Plaintiff, : v. :
: TAKE-TWO INTERACTIVE SOFTWARE, INC., ROCKSTAR GAMES, INC. and 2K SPORTS,: INC.,
Defendants. :
Friday, April 14, 2017 9:00 a.m., Discovery Dispute Hearing
Richards, Layton & Finger, P.A. 920 North King Street, Suite 2 Wilmington, Delaware 19801
BEFORE: SPECIAL MASTER Allen M. Terrell

Hawking Reporting Service

DOCKET

2

1	APPEARANCES:
2	DOWNER ANDERGON & CORRONN II C
3	POTTER ANDERSON & CORROON LLC BY: PHILIP ROVNER, ESQ.
4	-and-
5	KRAMER LEVIN NAFTALIS & FRANKEL LLP
6	BY: PAUL ANDRE, ESQ. BY: AARON FRANKEL, ESQ.
7	On behalf of Plaintiff
8	
9	
10	MORRIS, NICHOLS, ARSHT & TUNNELL LLP BY: JACK BLUMENFELD, ESQ.
11	-and-
12	WINSTON & STRAWN LLP BY: KATHLEEN BARRY, ESQ.
13	On behalf of Defendants
14	On Denair Or Derendants
15	PHILIPS, GOLDMAN, McLAUGHLIN & HILL,
16	P.A. BY: MEGAN HANEY, ESQ.
17	On behalf of Boeing
18	OIL DEMAIL OF BOEING
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
	Hawking Reporting Service

A L A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

DOCKET

Case 1:16-cv-00455-RGA Document 504 Filed 04/26/20 Page 3 of 203 PageID #: 34663

3

	د د
1	THE SPECIAL MASTER: So we're on
2	the record. For the record, I'm Allen Terrell,
3	Special Master, in the case of Acceleration Bay
4	LLC vs. Activision Blizzard, Inc, Civil Action
5	No. 16-453 and the related cases 16-454 and
6	16-455. This is a hearing on Plaintiff's Motion
7	to Compel and on Defendants' Motion to Compel.
8	We're going to begin by counsel
9	identifying themselves around the table for the
10	sake of the court reporter and this record.
11	MR. ANDRE: Paul Andre for
12	Plaintiff.
13	MR. FRANKEL: Aaron Frankel for
14	Plaintiff and with us is Phil Rovner also for
15	the Plaintiff.
16	MR. BLUMENFELD: Jack Blumenfeld
17	for the Defendants along with Kathleen Barry.
18	MS. HANEY: And Megan Haney also
19	for the Defendants and I'm just here for the
20	Boeing motion.
21	THE SPECIAL MASTER: We will begin
22	by agreement among the parties to consider the
23	first item being the Motion of Defendant to
24	Compel compliance with the Rule 45 subpoena to

Hawking Reporting Service

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET

LARM

Δ

Case 1:16-cv-00455-RGA Document 504 Filed 04/26/20 Page 4 of 203 PageID #: 34664

4

1	the Boeing company. On behalf of Defendants is
2	Ms. Haney. You can go ahead.
3	MS. HANEY: Actually, I believe
4	that Ms. Barry will do the arguments for
5	Defendants.
6	THE SPECIAL MASTER: Is that
7	right?
8	MS. BARRY: Yes.
9	THE SPECIAL MASTER: Let me also
10	tell counsel that I've read all of your briefs
11	and exhibits and I have suggested that we have
12	some reasonable limitations on time as we
13	proceed. But do your best and if you need more
14	time, I assure you can have it.
15	MS. BARRY: Thank you, Your Honor,
16	and counsel for the Plaintiff for the courtesy
17	of doing the Boeing motion first since Ms. Haney
18	is co-counsel with us with regards to the Boeing
19	motion. As an initial matter on the Boeing
20	motion, Boeing has agreed to have this motion
21	heard before the Special Master in the
22	procedures that are set up here for the Special
23	Master.
24	So we have two issues that we are

Hawking Reporting Service

DOCKET

RM

ALA

5

1 moving to compel Boeing on at this point. The first issue is we are seeking an order requiring 2 Boeing to provide a privilege log for any 3 documents that have been withheld on the basis 4 of privilege. And in response to that, Boeing 5 has made a couple of arguments. 6 7 First of all, Boeing has said that 8 they are not required to by reason of the protective order. We don't believe that is 9 correct. As an initial matter, the scheduling 10 11 order, which was issued after the protective order, provides a requirement that -- and 12 supersedes the protective order and provides 13 that all withheld documents with some limited 14 exceptions must be logged in full compliance 15 with Rule 26(b)(5)(a). I would direct the 16 17 Special Master to Paragraph 19 of the scheduling 18 order. Second, even if the scheduling 19 order, which was signed by Judge Andrews several 20 21 days after the protective order, is not the governing provision, the provision of the 22 protective order with regard to third parties as 23 24 the third parties may designate documents as

Hawking Reporting Service

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET A L A R M



Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.