

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

ACCELERATION BAY LLC, : CA NO. 16-453-RGA,
: 16-454-RGA, 16-455-RGA

Plaintiff, :

v. : July 10, 2017

ACTIVISION BLIZZARD INC., et :

al., :

Defendant. : 2:00 o'clock p.m.

.....:

TRANSCRIPT OF MOTION TO DISMISS
BEFORE THE HONORABLE RICHARD G. ANDREWS
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For Plaintiff: POTTER, ANDERSON & CORROON

BY: PHILIP A. ROVNER, ESQ

BY: ALAN R. SILVERSTEIN, ESQ

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-and-

KRAMER, LEVIN, NATALIS & FRANKEL

BY: PAUL J. ANDRE, ESQ

BY: JAMES R. HANNAH, ESQ

BY: AARON M. FRANKEL, ESQ

For Defendant:

MORRIS, NICHOLAS, ARSHT & TUNNEL

BY: JACK B. BLUMENFELD, ESQ

-and-

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

BY: MICHAEL A. TOMASULO, ESQ

BY: MICHAEL M. MURRAY, ESQ

BY: DAVID P. ENZIMINGER, ESQ

BY: ANDREW R. SOMMER, ESQ

BY: DAVID K. LIN, ESQ

Also Present:

OMER SALIK

JULIA KAZAKS

Activision Blizzard Representatives

KERRY HOPKINS

Electronic Arts Representatives

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

LINDA ZABRISKIE
Take 2 Interactive Software, Inc

Court Reporter: LEONARD A. DIBBS
Official Court Reporter

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

(The proceedings occurred at 2:00 o'clock p.m. as follows:)

:01:09

THE COURT: All right. Please be seated.
So this is an argument on the two Motions to Dismiss.
We've got to be finished by 3:00 o'clock here.
Who's arguing the motion? Which motion do you want to do first, defendants?

:01:30

MR. MURRAY: It's the 101 Motion, your Honor, is that okay?

THE COURT: Yes.
MR. MURRAY: Your Honor, I have some slides, okay?
May I approach?

:01:48

THE COURT: Yes.

(Pause)
MR. MURRAY: Can I begin?

THE COURT: Yes.

:02:14

MR. MURRAY: So I know that your Honor is very familiar with 101 and Alice. I'm just going to sort of dive right into the claims here and get to the issues that we need to address.

So Alice Step 1, are the claims directed to an abstract method.

:02:30

For these particular claims, the answer to that is easy to determine and the answer is yes.

1 The heart of the claim -- we have Claim 1 here -- on
2 the slide from the '344 patent. It's a representative claim.

3 You can see that literally everything in the claim,
4 other than the preamble, and a wherein clause that comes at the
:02:49 5 end, puts the method into some sort of context in terms of the
6 structure -- well, I'll talk about that. We addressed those
7 terms this morning, of course, in our regular -- et cetera.

8 But the rest of the claim is a straightforward abstract
9 method. It's an originating participant sends data to the other
:03:05 10 participants by sending the data through each of its connections
11 to its neighbor participants.

12 So that's sort of a first step. It's a data
13 transmission step.

14 And wherein each participant sends data that it
:03:17 15 receives from a neighbor to its other neighbor participates.

16 So you transmit the data, you receive, and then forward
17 it on. That's really all that says. That's the abstract method
18 under Alice Step 1.

19 When you look at the specification about how they
:03:29 20 illustrate this abstract method, they illustrate it with
21 abstract graphs, so that it's just a bunch of dots with lines
22 between them.

23 And that's the method of the claim.

24 We've animated this a little bit.

:03:43 25 So if the originating participant is H, it transmits

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.