

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE**

ACCELERATION BAY LLC,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 16-453 (RGA)
)	
ACTIVISION BLIZZARD, INC.,)	
)	
Defendant.)	
<hr/>		
ACCELERATION BAY LLC,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 16-454 (RGA)
)	
ELECTRONIC ARTS INC.,)	
)	
Defendant.)	
<hr/>		
ACCELERATION BAY LLC,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 16-455 (RGA)
)	
TAKE-TWO INTERACTIVE SOFTWARE,)	
INC., ROCKSTAR GAMES, INC. and)	
2K SPORTS, INC.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	

**PLAINTIFF ACCELERATION BAY LLC'S ANSWERING BRIEF
IN OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS,
STAY OR TRANSFER TO THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

OF COUNSEL:

Paul J. Andre
Lisa Kobialka
James R. Hannah
KRAMER LEVIN NAFTALIS
& FRANKEL LLP
990 Marsh Road
Menlo Park, CA 94025
(650) 752-1700

Aaron M. Frankel
KRAMER LEVIN NAFTALIS
& FRANKEL LLP
1177 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
(212) 715-9100

Dated: July 25, 2016
1229839

Philip A. Rovner (#3215)
Jonathan A. Choa (#5319)
POTTER ANDERSON & CORROON LLP
Hercules Plaza
P.O. Box 951
Wilmington, DE 19899
(302) 984-6000
provner@potteranderson.com
jchoa@potteranderson.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Acceleration Bay LLC

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Nature and Stage of Proceedings..... 1

II. Summary of the Argument 2

III. Statement of Facts 4

 A. The Parties Are All Delaware Corporations 4

 B. Acceleration Bay Filed its Patent Infringement Claims Against Defendants in 2015, and the Court Has Invested Substantial Resources in Presiding Over Those Actions 5

 C. Acceleration Bay’s 2016 Delaware Actions Are Continuations of the 2015 Delaware Actions..... 6

 D. Defendants’ DJ Actions Assert the Same Non-Infringement Defenses They Have Asserted in This Court Since 2015 7

IV. ARGUMENT..... 8

 A. Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss or Stay these Actions Should Be Denied..... 8

 1. Acceleration Bay Filed its Patent Infringement Claims Against Defendants in This District More Than One Year Before Defendants Filed Their DJ Actions in the Northern District of California 8

 2. Defendants Filed the DJ Actions In Naked Anticipation of Litigation, to Forum Shop and Frustrate Acceleration Bay’s Choice of Venue and to Delay Resolution of Acceleration Bay’s Claims 10

 3. Acceleration Bay’s Near Simultaneous Filing of the 2016 Delaware Actions Weighs Against Defendants’ First-to-File Claim..... 12

 B. These Actions Should Not Be Transferred to the Northern District of California 13

 1. Delaware is Home to All of the Parties 14

 2. Acceleration Bay Chose Delaware As the Forum to Prosecute its Claims Against Defendants and Defendants Acquiesced to That Choice 15

 3. Judicial Economy, Court Congestion, the Interest of Justice, and Other Practical Considerations Favor this Court Continuing to Preside Over Acceleration Bay’s Infringement Claims..... 16

 4. The Year of Litigation in this District Renders Moot the Location of Witnesses and Documents 18

 5. The Remaining Transfer Factors Are Neutral 20

V. Conclusion..... 20

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Federal Cases	
<i>Adobe Sys. Inc., v. Bargain Software Shop, LLC</i> , No. 14-CV-3721-EMC, 2014 WL 6982515 (N.D. Cal. Dec. 8, 2014).....	9
<i>Alltrade, Inc. v. Uniwald Prods., Inc.</i> , 946 F.2d 622	11
<i>Audatex N. Am., Inc. v. Mitchell Int'l, Inc.</i> , No. 12-CV-139 (GMS), 2013 WL 3293611 (D. Del. June 28, 2013)	15, 17
<i>Aurora Corp. of Am. v. Fellows, Inc.</i> , No. CV 07-8306-GHK, 2008 WL 709198 (C.D. Cal. Feb. 27, 2008).....	13
<i>Barnes & Noble, Inc. v. LSI Corp.</i> , 823 F.Supp.2d 980 (N.D. Cal. 2011)	9
<i>Cisco Sys., Inc. v. TiVo, Inc.</i> , No. C 12-02766 RS, 2012 WL 3279532 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 10, 2012).....	17, 19
<i>E.E.O.C. v. Univ. of Penn.</i> , 850 F.2d 969 (3d Cir. 1988).....	9, 12
<i>Elecs. for Imaging, Inc. v. Coyle</i> , 394 F.3d 1341 (Fed. Cir. 2005).....	10, 12
<i>Good Tech. Corp. v. MobileIron, Inc.</i> , No. CV 14-1308-LPS-CJB, 2015 WL 1458091 (D. Del. Mar. 27, 2015)	16, 18
<i>Hilton v. Apple, Inc.</i> , No. C-13-2167 EMC, 2013 WL 5487317 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 1, 2013).....	9
<i>Inherent.com v. Martindale-Hubbell</i> , 420 F.Supp.2d 1093 (N.D. Cal. 2006)	14
<i>Intellectual Ventures I LLC v. Altera Corp.</i> , 842 F. Supp. 2d 744 (D. Del. 2012).....	15
<i>Nordson Corp. v. Speedline Techs., Inc.</i> , No. C-00-2769 PJH, 2000 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 15240 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 10, 2000).....	13
<i>Ontel Prods., Inc. v. Project Strategies Corp.</i> , 899 F. Supp. 1144 (S.D.N.Y. 1995).....	13

Open LCR.com, Inc. v. Rates Tech., Inc.,
112 F. Supp. 2d 1223 (D. Colo. 2000).....10

Regents of the Univ. of California v. Eli Lilly & Co.,
119 F.3d 1559 (Fed. Cir. 1997).....17

Schering Corp. v. Amgen Inc.,
969 F. Supp. 258 (D. Del. 1997)..... *passim*

Semcon Tech., LLC v. Intel Corp.,
No. 12-531-RGA, 2013 WL 126421 (D. Del. Jan. 8, 2013).....18

Serco Servs. Co. v. Kelley Co.,
51 F.3d 1037 (Fed. Cir. 1995).....13

In re Telebrands Corp.,
No. 2016-106, 2016 WL 3033331 (Fed. Cir. Feb. 24, 2016)10

Thomas & Betts Corp., v. Hayes,
222 F.Supp.2d 994 (W.D. Tenn. 2002).....11

Time Warner Cable, Inc. v. GPNE Corp.,
497 F. Supp. 2d 584 (D. Del. 2007).....10, 12

Trustco Bank v. Automated Transactions LLC,
933 F. Supp. 2d 668 (D. Del. 2013).....14, 15, 20

Xoxide, Inc. v. Ford Motor Co.,
448 F.Supp.2d 1188 (C.D. Cal. 2006)11

State Cases

In re Citigroup Inc. S'holder Derivative Litig.,
964 A.2d 106 (Del. Ch. 2009).....12

Federal Statutes

28 U.S.C. § 1404(a)14

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.