

# EXHIBIT 1

**From:** Rovner, Philip A. <provner@potteranderson.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, September 27, 2019 9:54 AM  
**To:** Blumenfeld, Jack; Kraftschik, Stephen  
**Cc:** Choa, Jonathan A.  
**Subject:** RE: [EXT] Activity in Case 1:16-cv-00453-RGA Acceleration Bay LLC v. Activision Blizzard Inc. Answering Brief in Opposition

To address some new arguments raised by Activision in its opposition.



**Philip A. Rovner | Partner**

Potter Anderson & Corroon LLP | 1313 N. Market Street, 6th Floor | Wilmington, DE 19801-6108  
T 302.984.6140 | F 302.658.1192  
[provner@potteranderson.com](mailto:provner@potteranderson.com) | [potteranderson.com](http://potteranderson.com)

The information contained in this email message and any attachments is intended only for the addressee and is privileged, confidential, and may be protected from disclosure. Please be aware that any other use, printing, copying, disclosure or dissemination of this communication may be subject to legal restriction or sanction. If you think that you have received this email message in error, please do not read this message or any attached items. Please notify the sender immediately and delete the email and all attachments, including any copies. This email message and any attachments have been scanned for viruses and are believed to be free of any virus or other defect that might affect any computer system into which they are received and opened. However, it is the responsibility of the recipient to ensure that the email and any attachments are virus-free, and no responsibility is accepted by Potter Anderson & Corroon LLP for any loss or damage arising in any way from their use.

---

**From:** Blumenfeld, Jack [<mailto:JBlumenfeld@MNAT.com>]  
**Sent:** Friday, September 27, 2019 9:52 AM  
**To:** Rovner, Philip A. ; Kraftschik, Stephen  
**Cc:** Choa, Jonathan A.  
**Subject:** RE: [EXT] Activity in Case 1:16-cv-00453-RGA Acceleration Bay LLC v. Activision Blizzard Inc. Answering Brief in Opposition

Phil, sorry I didn't get back to you. I was traveling. What is the basis?

---

**From:** Rovner, Philip A. [<mailto:provner@potteranderson.com>]  
**Sent:** Friday, September 27, 2019 9:51 AM  
**To:** Blumenfeld, Jack; Kraftschik, Stephen  
**Cc:** Choa, Jonathan A.  
**Subject:** FW: [EXT] Activity in Case 1:16-cv-00453-RGA Acceleration Bay LLC v. Activision Blizzard Inc. Answering Brief in Opposition

Jack and Steve:

Following up on my vm to Jack from yesterday. We intend to seek leave to file a short reply. Please let me know if you will consent to the filing. Thanks.

Phil

---

**From:** [ded\\_nefreply@ded.uscourts.gov](mailto:ded_nefreply@ded.uscourts.gov) [[mailto:ded\\_nefreply@ded.uscourts.gov](mailto:ded_nefreply@ded.uscourts.gov)]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 25, 2019 1:08 PM  
**To:** [ded\\_ecf@ded.uscourts.gov](mailto:ded_ecf@ded.uscourts.gov)  
**Subject:** [EXT] Activity in Case 1:16-cv-00453-RGA Acceleration Bay LLC v. Activision Blizzard Inc. Answering Brief in Opposition

**This is an automatic e-mail message generated by the CM/ECF system. Please DO NOT RESPOND to this e-mail because the mail box is unattended.**

**\*\*\*NOTE TO PUBLIC ACCESS USERS\*\*\*** Judicial Conference of the United States policy permits attorneys of record and parties in a case (including pro se litigants) to receive one free electronic copy of all documents filed electronically, if receipt is required by law or directed by the filer. PACER access fees apply to all other users. To avoid later charges, download a copy of each document during this first viewing. However, if the referenced document is a transcript, the free copy and 30 page limit do not apply.

**U.S. District Court**

**District of Delaware**

### **Notice of Electronic Filing**

The following transaction was entered by Blumenfeld, Jack on 9/25/2019 at 1:07 PM EDT and filed on 9/25/2019

**Case Name:** Acceleration Bay LLC v. Activision Blizzard Inc.

**Case Number:** [1:16-cv-00453-RGA](#)

**Filer:** Activision Blizzard Inc.

**Document Number:** [696](#)

#### **Docket Text:**

**ANSWERING BRIEF in Opposition re [695] MOTION for Reconsideration of the Court's Memorandum Opinion Striking the SEER-SEM Methodology Used by Dr. Ricardo Valerdi -- Defendant Activision Blizzard, Inc.'s Opposition to Acceleration Bay's Motion for Reconsideration-- filed by Activision Blizzard Inc..Reply Brief due date per Local Rules is 10/2/2019. (Blumenfeld, Jack)**

#### **1:16-cv-00453-RGA Notice has been electronically mailed to:**

Aaron E Hankel [ahankel@shb.com](mailto:ahankel@shb.com), [p Carlyle@shb.com](mailto:p Carlyle@shb.com)

Aaron M. Frankel [afrankel@kramerlevin.com](mailto:afrankel@kramerlevin.com), [aaron-frankel-6173@ecf.pacerpro.com](mailto:aaron-frankel-6173@ecf.pacerpro.com)

Austin Manes [amanes@kramerlevin.com](mailto:amanes@kramerlevin.com)

B. Trent Webb [bwebb@shb.com](mailto:bwebb@shb.com), [bbebermeyer@shb.com](mailto:bbebermeyer@shb.com)

Cristina L. Martinez [cmartinez@kramerlevin.com](mailto:cmartinez@kramerlevin.com)

Gregory Brian Williams [gwilliams@foxrothschild.com](mailto:gwilliams@foxrothschild.com), [brayford@foxrothschild.com](mailto:brayford@foxrothschild.com)

Hannah Lee [hlee@kramerlevin.com](mailto:hlee@kramerlevin.com), [svdocketing@kramerlevin.com](mailto:svdocketing@kramerlevin.com)

Jack B. Blumenfeld [jbbefiling@mnat.com](mailto:jbbefiling@mnat.com), [winston-strawn-7942@ecf.pacerpro.com](mailto:winston-strawn-7942@ecf.pacerpro.com)

James R. Hannah [jhannah@kramerlevin.com](mailto:jhannah@kramerlevin.com), [svdocketing@kramerlevin.com](mailto:svdocketing@kramerlevin.com)

John C. Phillips , Jr [jcp@pgmhlaw.com](mailto:jcp@pgmhlaw.com), [tlb@pgslaw.com](mailto:tlb@pgslaw.com)

Jonathan A. Choa [jchoa@potteranderson.com](mailto:jchoa@potteranderson.com), [msingleton@potteranderson.com](mailto:msingleton@potteranderson.com)

Jordan T. Bergsten [jbergsten@shb.com](mailto:jbergsten@shb.com), [p Carlyle@shb.com](mailto:p Carlyle@shb.com)

Joseph C. Masullo [jmasullo@winston.com](mailto:jmasullo@winston.com)

Lisa Kobialka [lkobialka@kramerlevin.com](mailto:lkobialka@kramerlevin.com), [svdocketing@kramerlevin.com](mailto:svdocketing@kramerlevin.com)

Marcus A. Colucci [mcolucci@kramerlevin.com](mailto:mcolucci@kramerlevin.com), [litigation-5766@ecf.pacerpro.com](mailto:litigation-5766@ecf.pacerpro.com)

McGraw C. Maxwell [mmcgraw@shb.com](mailto:mmcgraw@shb.com), [dehardy@shb.com](mailto:dehardy@shb.com)

Michael A. Tomasulo [MTomasulo@winston.com](mailto:MTomasulo@winston.com)

Paul J. Andre [pandre@kramerlevin.com](mailto:pandre@kramerlevin.com), [svdocketing@kramerlevin.com](mailto:svdocketing@kramerlevin.com)

Philip A. Rovner [provner@potteranderson.com](mailto:provner@potteranderson.com), [asilverstein@potteranderson.com](mailto:asilverstein@potteranderson.com),  
[iplitigation@potteranderson.com](mailto:iplitigation@potteranderson.com), [jchoa@potteranderson.com](mailto:jchoa@potteranderson.com), [msingleton@potteranderson.com](mailto:msingleton@potteranderson.com),  
[shamlin@potteranderson.com](mailto:shamlin@potteranderson.com)

Shannon H. Hedvat [shedvat@kramerlevin.com](mailto:shedvat@kramerlevin.com)

Stephen J. Kraftschik [skraftschik@mnat.com](mailto:skraftschik@mnat.com)

Tanya Chaney [tchaney@shb.com](mailto:tchaney@shb.com), [dehardy@shb.com](mailto:dehardy@shb.com)

William Hannah [whannah@kramerlevin.com](mailto:whannah@kramerlevin.com)

Yuridia Caire [ycaire@kramerlevin.com](mailto:ycaire@kramerlevin.com)

**1:16-cv-00453-RGA Filer will deliver document by other means to:**

The following document(s) are associated with this transaction:

**Document description:**Main Document

**Original filename:**n/a

**Electronic document Stamp:**

[STAMP dcecfStamp\_ID=1079733196 [Date=9/25/2019] [FileNumber=3954379-0  
] [8aa42dd2e7e6ee7aff0e3af1ebf26745bb53cb0adf06ce2d4701c80242c35b325e3  
088da46c356d01a7ef5fc4cf7e15994cf4b1f60a7f5944fb38c291d45bc38]]



Philip A. Rovner | Partner  
Potter Anderson & Corroon LLP | 1313 N. Market Street, 6th Floor | Wilmington, DE 19801-6108  
T 302.984.6140 | F 302.658.1192  
[provner@potteranderson.com](mailto:provner@potteranderson.com) | [potteranderson.com](http://potteranderson.com)

The information contained in this email message and any attachments is intended only for the addressee and is privileged, confidential, and may be protected from disclosure. Please be aware that any other use, printing, copying, disclosure or dissemination of this communication may be subject to legal restriction or sanction. If you think that you have received this email message in error, please do not read this message or any attached items. Please notify the sender immediately and

any virus or other defect that might affect any computer system into which they are received and opened. However, it is the responsibility of the recipient to ensure that the email and any attachments are virus-free, and no responsibility is accepted by Potter Anderson & Corroon LLP for any loss or damage arising in any way from their use.

---

This message, including any accompanying documents or attachments, may contain information that is confidential or that is privileged. If you are not the intended recipient of this message, please note that the dissemination, distribution, use or copying of this message or any of the accompanying documents or attachments is strictly prohibited. If you believe that you may have received this message in error, please contact me at (302) 658-9200 or by return e-mail.