

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

ACCELERATION BAY LLC,)
)
Plaintiff,)

v.)

ACTIVISION BLIZZARD, INC.)
)
Defendant.)

C.A. No. 15-228 (RGA)
REDACTED VERSION

ACCELERATION BAY LLC,)
)
Plaintiff,)

v.)

ELECTRONIC ARTS INC.,)
)
Defendant.)

C.A. No. 15-282 (RGA)
REDACTED VERSION

ACCELERATION BAY LLC,)
)
Plaintiff,)

v.)

TAKE-TWO INTERACTIVE SOFTWARE,)
INC., ROCKSTAR GAMES, INC. and)
2K SPORTS, INC.,)
)
Defendants.)

C.A. No. 15-311 (RGA)
REDACTED VERSION

**DEFENDANTS' REPLY BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF THEIR
MOTION TO DISMISS FOR LACK OF STANDING**

MORRIS, NICHOLS, ARSHT & TUNNELL LLP
Jack B. Blumenfeld (#1014)
Stephen J. Kraftschik (#5623)
1201 North Market Street
P.O. Box 1347
Wilmington, DE 19899
(302) 658-9200
jblumenfeld@mnat.com
skraftschik@mnat.com

Attorneys for Defendants

Original Filing Date: March 30, 2016

Redacted Filing Date: April 11, 2016



OF COUNSEL:

Michael A. Tomasulo
David P. Enzminger
Gino Cheng
David K. Lin
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP
333 South Grand Avenue, 38th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071
(213) 615-1700

Daniel K. Webb
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP
35 West Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60601
(312) 558-5600

March 30, 2016

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	ii
I. AB LACKS PRUDENTIAL STANDING	1
A. AB does not own the patents.	1
B. AB does not have all substantial rights to the patents.	3
II. AB LACKS CONSTITUTIONAL STANDING	9
III. CONCLUSION	10

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Abbott Labs v. Diamedix Corp.</i> , 47 F.3d 1128 (Fed. Cir. 1995)	6, 8
<i>Alfred E. Mann Found. for Scientific Research v. Cochlear Corp.</i> , 604 F.3d 1354 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	6, 8
<i>Bluestone Innovations LLC v. Nichia Corp.</i> , No. C 12-00059 SI, 2013 WL 1729814 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 22, 2013)	5
<i>Canon Inc. v. Tesseron Ltd.</i> , No. 14CV5462(DLC), 2015 WL 7308663 (S.D.N.Y. Nov. 19, 2015)	10
<i>Clouding IP, LLC v. Google Inc.</i> , 61 F. Supp. 3d 421, 432 (D. Del. 2014)	1, 2
<i>Crown Die & Tool v. Nye Tool & Mach. Works</i> , 261 U.S. 24, 42 (1923)	5
<i>Diamond Coating Techs., LLC v. Hyundai Motor Am.</i> , No. 8:13-CV-01480-MRP, 2015 WL 2088892 (C.D. Cal. Apr. 1, 2015)	2
<i>Enhanced Security Research, LLC, v. Juniper Networks, Inc.</i> , 2010 WL 2898298 (D. Del. 2010).....	8
<i>Ethicon, Inc. v. U.S. Surgical Corp.</i> , 135 F.3d 1456 (Fed. Cir. 1998)	10
<i>Fieldturf v. Sw. Recreational Indus.</i> , 357 F.3d 1266 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	3
<i>Grant Cty. Constructors v. E. V. Lane Corp.</i> , 459 P.2d 947 (Wash. 1969)	2
<i>Hearst Commc'ns, Inc. v. Seattle Times Co.</i> , 115 P.3d 262 (Wash. 2005)	3
<i>High Point SARL v. T-Mobile USA, Inc.</i> , No. 2015-1235, 2016 WL 670402 (Fed. Cir. Feb. 18, 2016).....	10
<i>Int'l Gamco Inc. v. Multimedia Games</i> , 504 F.3d 1273 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	4, 5
<i>Luminara Worldwide, LLC v. Liown Elecs. Co.</i> , No. 2015-CV-1671, 2016 WL 797925 (Fed. Cir. Feb. 29, 2016)	7, 8

<i>MobileMedia Ideas, LLC v. Apple Inc.</i> , 885 F. Supp. 2d 700 (D. Del. 2012)	8
<i>Morrow v. Microsoft Corp.</i> , 499 F.3d 1332 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	5, 7, 8
<i>Pfizer, Inc. v. Elan Pharm. Research Corp.</i> , 812 F. Supp. 1352, 1373 (D. Del. 1993)	7
<i>Prima Tek II, L.L.C. v. A-Roo Co.</i> , 222 F.3d 1372 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	5
<i>Princeton Digital Image Corp. v. Hewlett-Packard</i> , No. 12 CIV. 6973 RJS, 2013 WL 1454945 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 21, 2013).....	4, 5
<i>Propat Int'l Corp. v. Rpost, Inc.</i> , 473 F.3d 1187 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	2, 8
<i>Rite-Hite Corp. v. Kelley Co., Inc.</i> , 56 F.3d 1538 (Fed. Cir. 1995) (en banc)	1
<i>Sicom Sys., Ltd. v. Agilent Techs., Inc.</i> , 427 F.3d 971 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	8
<i>Stasch v. Underwater Works</i> , 158 A.2d 809, 812 (Del. Super. 1960).....	6
<i>Walker Digital, LLC v. Expedia, Inc.</i> , 950 F. Supp. 2d 729 (D. Del. 2013)	3, 6
<i>Waterman v. Mackenzie</i> , 138 U.S. 252 (1891)	1, 3
<i>WiAV Sols. LLC v. Motorola, Inc.</i> , 631 F.3d 1257 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	10

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.