

# EXHIBIT A

2017-2474, -2475, -2476, -2478, -2479, -2480, -2482, -2483,  
2018-1050, -1079, -1080, -1081, -1082

---

---

**United States Court of Appeals  
for the Federal Circuit**

---

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO. LTD., MICRON TECHNOLOGY, INC.,  
SK HYNIX, INC.

*Appellants,*

v.

ELM 3DS INNOVATIONS LLC,

*Appellee.*

---

---

*Appeals from the United States Patent and Trademark Office, Patent Trial and  
Appeal Board in Inter Partes Review Nos. IPR2016-00386, IPR2016-00387,  
IPR2016-00388, IPR2016-00390, IPR2016-00391, IPR2016-00393,  
IPR2016-00394, IPR2016-00395, IPR2016-00708, IPR2016-00687,  
IPR2016-00691, IPR2016-00770, and IPR2016-00786*

---

---

**APPELLEE ELM 3DS INNOVATIONS LLC'S  
COMBINED PETITION FOR PANEL REHEARING  
AND REHEARING *EN BANC***

Michael T. Renaud  
mtrenaud@mintz.com  
James M. Wodarski  
jwodarski@mintz.com  
William A. Meunier  
wameunier@mintz.com  
Michael C. Newman  
mcnewman@mintz.com  
MINTZ LEVIN COHN FERRIS  
GLOVSKY AND POPEO PC  
One Financial Center  
Boston, MA 02111  
Tel. (617) 542.6000  
Fax (617) 542.2241

*Counsel for Appellee Elm 3DS Innovations LLC*

July 12, 2019

**CERTIFICATE OF INTEREST**

Counsel for Appellee Elm 3DS Innovations LLC certifies the following:

**1. The full name of every party represented by me is:**

Elm 3DS Innovations LLC

**2. The name of the real party in interest (if the party named in the caption is not the real party in interest) represented by me is:**

None.

**3. All parent corporations and any publicly held companies that own 10 percent or more of the stock of the party represented by me are:**

None.

**4. The names of all law firms and the partners or associates that appeared for the party now represented by me in the trial court or agency or are expected to appear in this Court (and who have not entered an appearance in this Court) are:**

Robins Kaplan LLP (Cyrus A. Morton and Kelsey Thorkelson).

Carmichael IP, PLLC (James Carmichael).

**5. The title and number of any case known to counsel to be pending in this or any other court or agency that will directly affect or be directly affected by this court's decision in the pending appeal:**

The following cases pending before the Delaware District Court: *Elm 3DS Innovations LLC v. Samsung Electronics Co. Ltd.*, Civil Action No. 1:14-cv-01430-LPS, *Elm 3DS Innovations LLC v. Micron Technology Inc.*, Civil Action No. 1:14-cv-01431-LPS, and *Elm 3DS Innovations LLC v. SK hynix Inc.*, Civil Action No. 1:14-cv-01432-LPS.

Dated: July 12, 2019

/s/ William A. Meunier  
William A. Meunier

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

CERTIFICATE OF INTEREST .....i

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....iv

FEDERAL CIRCUIT RULE 35(b)(2) STATEMENT OF COUNSEL ..... 1

I. Summary .....2

II. Points of Law or Fact Overlooked or Misapprehended By The Panel.....4

III. The Panel Should Grant Rehearing To Omit The 50 Microns Requirement.....5

    A. The Court Need Not Resolve The 50 Microns Dispute .....5

    B. Examples Are Not Clear And Unambiguous Disavowals .....7

    C. “50 Microns” Was An Example Of A Sufficiently Low Value, Not A Clear And Unambiguous Disavowal..... 10

        1. “50 Microns” Was Merely An Example Of A Sufficiently Low Thinness..... 11

        2. The Prosecution History’s Indefiniteness Rejection Response Did Not Clearly And Unambiguously Disavow Substantially Flexible Substrates Thicker Than 50 Microns ..... 12

        3. There Is No Evidence That A POSITA Would Understand That Substantially Flexible Substrates Thicker Than 50 Microns Were Disavowed..... 15

        4. The Claim Differentiation Doctrine Confirms There Was No Disavowal Of Sufficiently Thinned Substrates That Are Thicker Than 50 Microns..... 17

IV. The En Banc Court Should Grant Rehearing To Consider and Modify Its “Substantially Flexible” Construction To Omit The 50 Microns Requirement..... 18

V. Conclusion ..... 19

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.