

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF FEDERAL CLAIMS

E-NUMERATE SOLUTIONS, INC. and
E-NUMERATE, LLC,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE UNITED STATES,

Defendant.

No. 19-859 C

Judge Ryan T. Holte

PLAINTIFFS' BRIEF IN OPPOSITION TO THE UNITED STATES'
MOTION TO DISMISS UNDER RULE 12(b)(6)

O'KELLY & ERNST, LLC
Sean T. O'Kelly (No. 4349)
824 N. Market St., Suite 1001A
Wilmington, DE 19801
(302) 778-4000
(302) 295-2873 (facsimile)
sokelly@oelegal.com

O'ROURKE LAW OFFICE, LLC
Gerard M. O'Rourke (No. 3265)
1201 N. Orange Street
Suite 7260
Wilmington, DE 19801-1186
(302) 562-6960
gorourke@orourkefirm.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Dated: December 20, 2019

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION..... 1

F. STANDARDS GOVERNING A MOTION TO DISMISS..... 11

G. THE LAW GOVERNING MOTIONS BASED ON 35 U.S.C. § 101 13

 i. The Law On Patent-Ineligible Concepts 14

 ii. The Law Of Inventive Concept 16

V. ARGUMENT 20

 A. THE CLAIMS OF THE '355 PATENT ARE PATENTABLE UNDER § 101..... 21

 1. The claims are not directed to an abstract idea..... 23

 2. The Claims Contain an Inventive Concept Under *Alice* Step 2. 23

 3. The '355 Patent Is Entitled To An Especially Strong Presumption Of Validity 24

 4. Factual Disputes Over Step 2 Preclude Granting This Motion 25

 5. Claim 2 Is Not Representative Of The Asserted Claims 25

 B. THE CLAIMS OF THE '816 PATENT ARE PATENTABLE UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 101
27

 1. The Claims of the '816 are not directed to an Abstract idea. 27

 2. The Claims Contain An Inventive Concept..... 30

 4. Factual Disputes Over Step 2 Preclude Granting This Motion..... 31

 5. Claim 3 Is Not Representative Of The Asserted Claims 31

 K. CLAIMS OF THE '383 PATENT ARE PATENTABLE UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 101 31

1 The Claims of the ‘383 are not directed to an Abstract idea.	31
L. CLAIMS OF THE ‘748 PATENT ARE PATENTABLE UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 101	33
1. The Claims of the ‘748 patent are not directed to an Abstract idea.	34
3. The Claims Contain An Inventive Concept.....	36
4. Factual Disputes Over Alice Step 2 Preclude Granting This Motion.....	37
5. Claim 2 Is Not Representative Of The Asserted Claims	37
M. CLAIMS OF THE ‘337 PATENT ARE PATENTABLE UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 101	38
4. The ‘384 patent and the ‘748 patent are patentable.....	42
N. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION ISSUES COMPEL DENIAL OF THE GOVERNMENT’S MOTION.....	42
O. The Court Cannot Disregard Allegations In the Complaint.....	43
VI. CONCLUSION	45

..

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

Aatrix Software, Inc. v. Green Shades Software, Inc., 882 F.3d 1121 (Fed. Cir. 2018)..... passim

Acceleration Bay, LLC, v. Activision Blizzard, Inc., 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 138623 (D. Del. August 29, 2017)..... 15, 29

Affinity Labs of Texas, LLC, v. DIRECTV, LLC, 838 F.3d 1353 (Fed. Cir. 2016)..... 19

Alice Corp. Pty. Ltd. v. CLS Bank Int’l, 573 U.S. 208 (2014)..... 9, 13, 14

Art+Com Innovation Pool GMBH v. Google, Inc., 183 F. Supp. 3d 552 (D. Del. 2016) 15, 37

Ass’n for Molecular Pathology v. Myriad Genetics, Inc., 133 S. Ct. 2107 (2013)..... 13

Athena Diagnostics, Inc. v. Mayo Collaborative Servs., LLC, 915 F.3d 743 (Fed. Cir. 2019) 44

BASCOM Global Internet Servs., v. AT&T Mobility LLC, 827 F.3d 1341 (Fed. Cir. 2016).. 16, 17

Berkheimer v. HP Inc., 881 F.3d 1360 (Fed. Cir. 2018)..... passim

Cary v. United States, 552 F.3d 1373 (Fed. Cir. 2009) 12

Cellspin Soft, Inc. v. Fitbit, Inc., 927 F.3d 1306 (Fed. Cir. 2019)..... 45

ChargePoint, Inc. v. SemaConnect, Inc., 920 F.3d 759 (Fed. Cir. 2019)..... 27

Clarilogic, Inc. v. FormFree Holdings Corp., 681 Fed. Appx. 950 (Fed. Cir. 2017) 20

Data Engine Techs. LLC v. Google LLC, 906 F.3d 999 (Fed. Cir. 2019) 20

DDR Holdings, LLC v. Hotels.com, L.P., 773 F.3d 1245 (Fed. Cir. 2014)..... 16, 23, 29

Elec. Power Group, LLC v. Alston S.A., 830 F.3d 1350 (Fed. Cir. 2016)..... 27

Enfish, LLC, v. Microsoft Corporation, 822 F.3d 1327 (Fed. Cir. 2017)..... passim

Hewlett–Packard Co. v. Bausch & Lomb Inc., 909 F.2d 1464 (Fed. Cir. 1990)..... 25

Idexx Labs, Inc. v. Charles River Labs, Inc., 2016 U.S. Dist. Lexis 87888 (D. Del. July 1, 2016) 15

...

In re Bilski, 545 F.3d 943 (Fed. Cir. 2008)..... 9

Intellectual Ventures I LLC v. Capital One Fin. Corp., 850 F.3d 1332 (Fed. Cir. 2017)
 19, 20, 36, 40

Intellectual Ventures LLC v. Erie Indem. Co., 850 F.3d 1315 (Fed. Cir. 2017)..... 19, 20

Intervet Am., Inc. v. Kee—Vet Labs., Inc., 887 F.2d 1050 (Fed. Cir. 1989)..... 25

JSDQ Mesh Techs. LLC v. Fluidmesh Networks, LLC, 2016 WL 4639140 (D. Del. Sept. 6, 2016)
 12

Mayo Collaborative Services v. Prometheus Laboratories, Inc., 132 S. Ct. 1289 (2012) 13, 14

Mayo Collaborative Servs. v. Prometheus Labs, Inc., 566 U.S. 66 (2012)..... 8

McRO, Inc., v. Bandai Namco, 837 F.3d 1299, 1316 (Fed. Cir. 2016) 16

Messaging Gateway, 2015 WL1744343 (D. Del. 2015) 30, 37

Newell Companies, Inc. v. Kenney Mfg. Co., 864 F.2d 757 (Fed. Cir. 1988) 45

OIP Techs., Inc. v. Amazon.com, Inc., 788 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2015)..... 20

SAP Am., Inc. v. InvestPic. LLC, 898 F.3d 1161 (Fed. Cir. 2018) 20

Sciele Pharma, Inc. v. Lupin Ltd., 684 F.3d 1253 (Fed. Cir. 2012)..... 45

Sonos, Inc. v. D&M Holdings, Inc., 2017 U.S. Dist LEXIS 35272 (D. Del. March 13, 2017) 15

State Street Bank & Trust Co. v. Signature Financial Group, Inc., 149 F.3d 1368 (Fed. Cir.
 1998)..... 8

Univ. of Florida Research v. General Elec. Co., 916 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2019)..... 27

Wang Labs, Inc. v America Online, Inc., 197 F.3d 1377 (Fed. Cir. 1999)..... 19

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 101 12, 13, 24

Regulations

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.