

1 NIMALKA R. WICKRAMASEKERA (SBN: 268518)
nwickramasekera@winston.com
2 DAVID P. DALKE (SBN: 218161)
ddalke@winston.com
3 WINSTON & STRAWN LLP
333 S. Grand Avenue
4 Los Angeles, CA 90071-1543
Telephone: (213) 615-1700
5 Facsimile: (213) 615-1750

6 GEORGE C. LOMBARDI (*pro hac vice*)
glombaridi@winston.com
7 BRIAN J. NISBET (*pro hac vice*)
bnisbet@winston.com
8 SARANYA RAGHAVAN (*pro hac vice*)
sraghavan@winston.com
9 WINSTON & STRAWN LLP
35 West Wacker Drive
10 Chicago, IL 60601-9703
Telephone: (312) 558-5600
11 Facsimile: (312) 558-5700

12 CORINNE STONE HOCKMAN (*pro hac vice*)
chockman@winston.com
13 WINSTON & STRAWN LLP
800 Capitol Street, Suite 2400
14 Houston, TX 77002-2529
Telephone: (713) 651-2600
15 Facsimile: (713) 651-2700

16 Attorneys for Defendants
ALPHATEC HOLDINGS, INC. AND ALPHATEC SPINE, INC.
17

18 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

19 **SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA – SAN DIEGO DIVISION**

20 NUVASIVE, INC., a Delaware
corporation,
21
Plaintiff,
22
v.
23
ALPHATEC HOLDINGS, INC., a
24 Delaware corporation and
ALPHATEC SPINE, INC., a
25 California corporation,
26
Defendants.
27
28

Case No. 3:18-CV-00347-CAB-MDD

[Assigned to Courtroom 4C – Honorable
Cathy Ann Bencivengo]

**DEFENDANTS’ OPPOSITION TO
MOTION TO STRIKE INVALIDITY
CONTENTIONS**

PER CHAMBERS RULES, NO ORAL
ARGUMENT UNLESS SEPARATELY
ORDERED BY THE COURT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

I. INTRODUCTION..... 1

II. FACTUAL BACKGROUND 4

 A. Overview of Alphatec’s on-sale bar and public-use defenses..... 4

 B. Alphatec’s on-sale bar and public-use invalidity contentions..... 6

 C. NuVasive withheld the information that forms the basis of its motion until discovery closed..... 9

 D. Alphatec’s *inter partes* review proceedings and request for stay. 13

III. LEGAL STANDARD..... 15

IV. ARGUMENT 16

 A. Alphatec is not estopped from raising on-sale and public-use defenses..... 16

 1. Alphatec could not have raised these defenses in IPR..... 16

 2. Alphatec is not estopped from relying on NuVasive’s implants (*i.e.*, devices) based on the “Wayback Machine” document. 18

 B. Alphatec is not estopped from challenging the patents’ priority dates..... 21

V. CONCLUSION 22

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

Biscotti Inc. v. Microsoft Corp.,
 No. 13-CV-01015-JRG-RSP, 2017 WL 2526231 (E.D. Tex. May 11,
 2017)..... 19, 21

Contour IP Holding, LLC v. GoPro, Inc.,
 No. 17-CV-04738-WHO, 2020 WL 109063 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 9, 2020)..... 20

Depomed, Inc. v. Purdue Pharma L.P.,
 No. 13-CV-571-MLC, 2016 WL 8677317 (D.N.J. Nov. 4, 2016)..... 17

Dynamic Drinkware, LLC v. Nat’l Graphics, Inc.,
 800 F.3d 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....5, 22

GoPro, Inc. v. Contour IP Holding LLC,
 908 F.3d 690 (Fed. Cir. 2018) 20

Gree, Inc. v. Supercell Oy,
 No. 19-CV-00071-JRG-RSP, 2020 WL 4999689 (E.D. Tex. July 9,
 2020)..... 17, 18

Helsinn Healthcare S.A. v. Teva Pharm. USA, Inc.,
 139 S.Ct. 628 (2019)..... 21

Medline Indus., Inc. v. C.R. Bard, Inc.,
 No. 17-CV-7216, 2020 WL 5512132 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 14, 2020)..... 4, 15, 17, 19

Nidec Motor Corp. v. Zhongshan Broad Ocean Motor Co. Matal,
 868 F.3d 1013 (Fed. Cir. 2017)..... 22

Odyssey Wireless, Inc. v. Apple Inc.,
 No. 15-CV-01735-H-RBB, 2016 WL 7634450 (S.D. Cal. Sept. 13,
 2016)..... 5

Oil-Dri Corp. of Am. v Nestlé Purina Petcare Co.,
 No. 15-CV-1067, 2019 WL 861394 (N.D. Ill. Feb. 22, 2019).....18, 19, 20

Paice LLC v. Ford Motor Co.,
 No. 14-CV-00492-WDQ, 2014 WL 12934576 (D. Md. Nov. 6, 2014)13, 14, 15, 17

1 *Pavo Sols. LLC v. Kingston Tech. Co., Inc.*,
 2 No. 14-CV-01352-JLS-KES, 2020 WL 1049911 (C.D. Cal. Feb. 18,
 3 2020)..... 16, 19

4 *Polaris Indus., Inc. v. Arctic Cat Inc.*,
 5 No. 15-CV-4475-JRT-TNL, 2019 WL 3824255 (D. Minn. Aug. 15,
 6 2019)..... 19

7 *Rensselaer Polytechnic Inst. v. Apple Inc.*,
 8 No. 1:13-CV-0633-DEP, 2014 WL 201965 (N.D.N.Y. Jan. 15, 2014) 15, 17

9 *SPEX Techs. Inc v. Kingston Tech. Corp.*,
 10 No. 16-CV-01790-JVS-AGRx, 2020 WL 4342254 (C.D. Cal. June 16,
 11 2020)..... 16

12 *Star Envirotech, Inc. v. Redline Detection, LLC*,
 13 No. 12-CV-01861, 2015 WL 4744394 (C.D. Cal. Jan. 29, 2015)..... 20

14 *Synopsys, Inc. v. Mentor Graphics Corp.*,
 15 814 F.3d 1309 (Fed. Cir. 2016), *overruled on other grounds by Aqua*
 16 *Prod., Inc. v. Matal*, 872 F.3d 1290 (Fed. Cir. 2017) 1, 16, 17

17 *Vaporstream, Inc. v. Snap Inc.*,
 18 No. 17-CV-00220-MLH-KSx, 2020 WL 136591 (C.D. Cal. Jan. 13,
 19 2020).....*passim*

20 *Wasica Fin. GmbH v. Schrader Int’l, Inc.*,
 21 432 F. Supp. 3d 448 (D. Del. 2020).....18, 19, 20

22 *Zitovault, LLC v. Int’l Bus. Machines Corp.*,
 23 No. 16-CV-0962-M, 2018 WL 2971178 (N.D. Tex. Apr. 4, 2018) 21

24 **Statutes**

25 35 U.S.C. § 1011, 15

26 35 U.S.C. § 102*passim*

27 35 U.S.C. § 102(a).....1, 17

28 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) 4, 19, 21, 22

35 U.S.C. § 1031, 17

1 35 U.S.C. § 1031, 15
2 35 U.S.C. § 1121, 15
3 35 U.S.C. § 311(b)*passim*
4 35 U.S.C. § 315(e)(2)*passim*
5

6 **Other Authorities**

7 Fed. R. Civ. P. 33(d)..... 12
8 S.D. Cal. Patent L.R. 3.2(a) 2, 9
9 S.D. Cal. Patent L.R. 3.39
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.