

1 Allison H. Goddard (211098)
ali@pattersonlawgroup.com
2 PATTERSON LAW GROUP
402 West Broadway, 29th Floor
3 San Diego, CA 92101
(619) 398-4760
4 (619) 756-6991 (facsimile)

5 *Attorneys for Plaintiff,*
Wi-LAN Inc.
6
7
8

9 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
10 **SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
11 **SAN DIEGO**

13 WI-LAN INC.,

14 *Plaintiff,*

15 v.

16 APPLE INC.,

17 *Defendant.*

No.: 3:14-cv-1507-DMS (BLM); (Lead
Case No. 3:14-cv-2235-DMS-BLM)

**WI-LAN'S OPPOSITION TO APPLE'S
50(B) MOTION AND/OR MOTION
FOR NEW TRIAL**

REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING

Department: 13A
Judge: Hon. Dana M. Sabraw
Magistrate Judge: Hon. Barbara L. Major
Hearing: November 30, 2018
Time: 1:30 pm

21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

E. Remittitur Is Not Warranted 25

V. CONCLUSION 25

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

		Page(s)
1		
2		
3	Cases	
4	<i>Ameranth, Inc. v. Genesis Gaming Sols., Inc.</i> ,	
5	11-0189 AG (RNBx), 2014 WL 12577148 (C.D. Cal. Aug. 4,	
6	2014).....	11
7	<i>Apple Inc. v. Motorola, Inc.</i> ,	
8	757 F.3d 1286 (Fed. Cir. 2014).....	19
9	<i>Apple, Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co.</i> ,	
10	No. 11-CV-01846-LHK, 2012 WL 2571332 (N.D. Cal. June 30,	
11	2012).....	21
12	<i>Aqua Shield v. Inter Pool Cover Team</i> ,	
13	774 F.3d 766 (Fed. Cir. 2014).....	14
14	<i>Arctic Cat Inc. v. Bombardier Recreational Prod. Inc.</i> ,	
15	876 F.3d 1350 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....	19
16	<i>Aspex Eyewear, Inc. v. Marchon Eyewear, Inc.</i> ,	
17	672 F.3d 1335 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	11
18	<i>AstraZeneca AB v. Apotex Corp.</i> ,	
19	782 F.3d 1324 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	17
20	<i>Brighton Collectibles, Inc. v. Marc Chantal USA, Inc.</i> ,	
21	No. 06-CV-1584 H (POR), 2009 WL 10674076 (S.D. Cal. Aug.	
22	12, 2009).....	1, 2
23	<i>Estate of Bynum v. Magno</i> ,	
24	55 F. App'x 811 (9th Cir. 2003).....	5, 22
25	<i>Carucel Invs. v. Novatel Wireless, Inc.</i> ,	
26	No. 16-cv-118, 2017 WL 1394068 (S.D. Cal. March 2, 2017)	11
27	<i>CSIRO v. Cisco Sys., Inc.</i> ,	
28	809 F.3d 1295 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	15, 16, 18
	<i>DSC Commc'ns Corp. v. Pulse Commc'ns, Inc.</i> ,	
	170 F.3d 1354 (Fed. Cir. 1999).....	9

1 *Dzielak v. Whirlpool Corp.*,
 No. 12-0089 (KM)(JBC), 2017 WL 1034197 (D.N.J. Mar. 17,
 2 2017)..... 21
 3
 4 *Eisenbise v. Crown Equip. Corp.*,
 260 F. Supp. 3d 1250 (S.D. Cal. 2017) 19
 5
 6 *Enovys LLC v. Nextel Commc’ns, Inc.*,
 614 F.3d 1333 (Fed. Cir. 2010) 3
 7
 8 *Ericsson, Inc. v. D-Link Sys., Inc.*,
 773 F.3d 1201 (Fed. Cir. 2014) *passim*
 9
 10 *Hiramanek v. Clark*,
 No. 13-cv-00228-RMW, 2016 WL 6459548 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 31,
 2016)..... 24
 11
 12 *HTC Corp. v. IPCom GmbH & Co.*,
 667 F.3d 1270 (Fed. Cir. 2008) 9
 13
 14 *i4i Ltd. P’ship v. Microsoft Corp.*,
 598 F.3d 831 (Fed. Cir. 2010) 13, 15, 18
 15
 16 *Ironworks Patents, LLC v. Apple, Inc.*,
 255 F. Supp. 3d 513 (D. Del. 2017) 23
 17
 18 *Kaist IP US LLC v. Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd.*,
 No. 16-CV-01314-JPG-RSP, 2018 WL 2688185 (E.D. Tex. June 5,
 2018)..... 16, 17
 19
 20 *KFX Med., Corp. v. Arthrex*,
 No. 11CV698 DMS (BLM), 2014 WL 11970553 (S.D. Cal. Feb.
 21 18, 2014)..... 1
 22
 23 *Microsoft Corp. v. Motorola, Inc.*,
 904 F. Supp. 2d 1109 (W.D. Wash. 2012) 21
 24
 25 *Molski v. M.J. Cable, Inc.*,
 481 F.3d 724 (9th Cir. 2007) 1
 26
 27 *Mondis Tech., Ltd. V. LG Elecs., Inc.*,
 No. 2:07-CV-565-TJW-CE, 2011 WL 24117367 (E.D. Tex. June
 28 14 2011)..... 23

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.